# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

OF OREGON

UM 1431

In the Matter of

VERIZON COMMUNICATIONS INC. and FRONTIER COMMUNICATIONS CORPORATION

Joint Application for an Order Declining to Assert Jurisdiction, or, in the alternative, to Approve the Indirect Transfer of Control of VERIZON NORTHWEST INC. SUPERSEDING HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTIVE ORDER

DISPOSITION: MOTION FOR HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTIVE ORDER GRANTED

On June 30, 2009, Verizon Northwest Inc. and Frontier Communications Corporation (collectively, Applicants) filed a Motion for Highly Confidential Protective Order (Motion). The Motion arises out of discussions held during the prehearing conference that were reflected in the June 19, 2009, Prehearing Conference Report: "The parties further agreed that a Joint Motion would be submitted establishing procedures for the treatment of especially sensitive and highly confidential information."

Applicants worked with the other parties in the case and reached agreement on the form and language submitted with the Motion. Given there should be no objection from the other parties, Applicants request the Commission issue the Highly Confidential Protective Order at its earliest opportunity.

**Discussion.** Having reviewed the Motion and Protective Order, good cause having been shown, and no objections having been interposed to its adoption, the Motion should be granted. On July 14, 2009, the Commission entered Highly Confidential Protective Order No. 09-271 adopting the form and language attached to the Applicant's Motion. This Superseding Highly Confidential Order, which comports with accepted Commission practice and procedure, supersedes and replaces, in its entirety, Order No. 09-271.

## **ORDER**

The Motion for Highly Confidential Protective Order filed by Verizon Northwest Inc. and Frontier Communications Corporation is GRANTED.

A Superseding Highly Confidential Protective Order is affixed to this Order as Appendix A and made a part hereof.

Made, entered, and effective on

Allan J. Arlow Administrative Law Judge

A party may appeal this order to the Commission pursuant to OAR 860-014-0091.

### SUPERSEDING HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTIVE ORDER

#### UM 1431

## Scope of this Order-

1. This order replaces and supersedes Order No. 09-271, in its entirety, and is hereafter referred to as the "Superseding Order." This order governs the acquisition and use of "Highly Confidential Information" in this proceeding.

#### Definition-

2. "Highly Confidential Information" is competitively-sensitive confidential information that falls within the scope of ORCP 36(C)(7) ("a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information"), the disclosure of which presents risk of business harm.

## Designation and Disclosure of Highly Confidential Information-

- 3. Intervenors in this proceeding may include competitors, or potential competitors. Moreover, information relevant to the resolution of this case is expected to include sensitive competitive information. Parties to this proceeding may receive discovery requests that call for the disclosure of highly confidential documents or information, the disclosure of which imposes a significant risk of competitive harm to the disclosing party or third parties. Parties may designate documents or information they consider to be Highly Confidential, and such documents or information will be disclosed only in accordance with the provisions of this Superseding Order.
- 4. Parties must carefully scrutinize responsive documents and information and limit the amount of information they designate as Highly Confidential Information to only information that truly might impose a serious business risk if disseminated without the heightened protections provided in this Superseding Order. The first page and individual pages of a document determined in good faith to include Highly Confidential Information must be marked by a stamp that reads:

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – USE RESTRICTED PER SUPERSEDING HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTIVE ORDER NO. 09-273 IN DOCKET UM 1431.

- 5. Placing a "Highly Confidential" stamp on the first page of a document will not serve to protect the entire contents of a multi-page document. To ensure protection, each page that contains "Highly Confidential" material must be printed on green paper, marked separately as "Highly Confidential," and provided under seal. Multiple pages from a document containing "Highly Confidential" information may be sealed in the same envelope. A separate envelope must be provided for each document or filing. An original and five copies, each separately sealed, must be provided to the Commission. The redacted version of the document must be highlighted or otherwise marked to show where the "Highly Confidential" material has been redacted.
- 6. For each person for whom access to Highly Confidential Information is sought, parties must submit to the party who designated the material as Highly Confidential and file with the Commission a Superseding Highly Confidential Information Agreement, in the form prescribed by this Superseding Order, certifying that the person requesting access to Highly Confidential Information:

Has a need to know for the purpose of presenting its party's case in this proceeding and is not engaged in developing, planning, marketing, or selling products or services or determining the costs thereof to be charged or potentially charged to customers; and

Has read and understands, and agrees to be bound by, the terms of the General Protective Order in this proceeding, as well as the terms of this Superseding Highly Confidential Protective Order.

- 7. The restrictions in paragraph 6 do not apply to Commission Staff employees or attorneys in the Office of the Attorney General representing Commission Staff. However, Commission Staff must submit the Superseding Highly Confidential Information Agreement, in the form prescribed by this Superseding Order, for any external experts or consultants they wish to have review the Highly Confidential Information.
- 8. Any party may object in writing to the designation of any individual counsel or consultant as a person who may review Highly Confidential documents or information. The objection must be filed within 10 days of the filing of the Superseding Highly Confidential Information Agreement. Any such objection must demonstrate good cause, supported by affidavit, to exclude the challenged counsel or consultant from the review of Highly Confidential documents or information. Written response to any objection must be filed within five days after filing of the objection. If, after receiving a written response to a party's objection, the objecting party still objects to disclosure of the Highly Confidential Information to the challenged individual, the Commission shall determine whether the Highly Confidential Information must be disclosed to the challenged individual.

- 9. Designated counsel and consultants will each maintain the Highly Confidential documents and information and any notes reflecting their contents in a secure location to which only designated counsel and consultants have access. No additional copies will be made, except for use as part of prefiled testimonies or exhibits or during the hearing, and then such copies are also subject to the provisions of this Superseding Order. The Commission's Administrative Hearings Division shall store the Highly Confidential information in a locked cabinet dedicated to the storage of Confidential Information.
- 10. Staff of designated counsel and staff of designated consultants who are authorized to review Highly Confidential Information may have access to Highly Confidential documents or information for purposes of processing the case, including but not limited to receiving and organizing discovery, and preparing prefiled testimony, hearing exhibits, and briefs. Counsel and consultants are responsible for appropriate supervision of their staff to ensure the protection of all confidential information consistent with the terms of this Superseding Order.
- 11. Any testimony or exhibits prepared that include or reflect Highly Confidential Information must be maintained in the secure location until filed with the Commission or removed to the hearing room for production under seal and under circumstances that will ensure continued protection from disclosure to persons not entitled to review Highly Confidential documents or information. Counsel will provide prior notice (at least one business day) of any intention to introduce such material at hearing or refer to such materials in cross-examination of a witness. The presiding officer(s) will determine the process for including such documents or information following consultation with the parties.
- 12. The designation of any document or information as Highly Confidential may be challenged by motion, and the classification of the document or information as Highly Confidential will be considered in chambers by the presiding officer(s).
- 13. Highly Confidential documents and information will be provided to Commission Staff and the Commission under the same terms and conditions of this Superseding Order and as otherwise provided by the terms of the General Protective Order filed in this proceeding.

# Appeal/Subsequent Proceedings-

14. Sealed portions of the record in this proceeding may be forwarded to any court of competent jurisdiction for purposes of an appeal or to the Federal Communications Commssion (FCC), but under seal as designated herein for the information and use of the court or the FCC. If a portion of the record is forwarded

to a court or the FCC, the providing party shall be notified which portion of the sealed record has been designated by the appealing party as necessary to the record on appeal or for use at the FCC.

# Summary of Record-

15. If deemed necessary by the Commission, the providing party shall prepare a written summary of the Confidential Information referred to in the Superseding Order to be placed on the public record.

# Preservation of Confidentiality-

16. All persons who are given access to Highly Confidential Information by reason of this Superseding Order may not use or disclose the Highly Confidential Information for any purpose other than the purposes of preparation for and conduct of this proceeding, and must take all necessary precautions to keep the Highly Confidential Information secure. Disclosure of Highly Confidential Information for purposes of business competition is strictly prohibited.

#### **Duration of Protection-**

17. The Commission shall preserve the confidentiality of Highly Confidential Information for a period of five years from the date of the final order in this docket, unless extended by the Commission at the request of the party desiring confidentiality. The Commission shall notify the party desiring confidentiality at least two weeks prior to the release of Highly Confidential Information. This Superseding Order shall continue in force and effect after docket UM 1431 is closed, as set out in this paragraph.

# **Destruction After Proceeding-**

18. Counsel of record may retain memoranda, pleadings, testimony, discovery, or other documents containing Highly Confidential Information to the extent reasonably necessary to maintain a file of this proceeding or to comply with requirements imposed by another governmental agency or court order. The information retained may not be disclosed to any person. Any other person retaining Highly Confidential Information or documents containing such Highly Confidential Information must destroy or return it to the party desiring confidentiality within 90 days after final resolution of this proceeding unless the party desiring confidentiality consents, in writing, to retention of the Highly Confidential Information or documents containing such Highly Confidential Information. This paragraph does not apply to the Commission or its Staff.

### Additional Protection-

- 19. The party desiring additional protection may move for any of the remedies set forth in ORCP 36(C). The motion shall state:
  - a. The parties and persons involved;
  - b. The exact nature of the information involved;
  - c. The exact nature of the relief requested;
  - d. The specific reasons the requested relief is necessary;
  - e. A detailed description of the intermediate measures, including selected redaction, explored by the parties and why such measures do not resolve the dispute.

The information need not be released and, if released, may not be disclosed pending the Commission's ruling on the motion.

# SUPERSEDING HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION AGREEMENT DOCKET NO. UM 1431

Ι,	, as
In-house attorney In-house expert Outside counsel Outside expert	
in this proceeding for proceeding) hereby declare under penalty of p Oregon that the following are true and correct	
<del></del>	of presenting my party's case in this veloping, planning, marketing, or selling e costs thereof to be charged or potentially
<ul> <li>I have read and understand, and agree Protective Order in this proceeding, as Highly Confidential Protective Order.</li> </ul>	
Full Name (Printed)	
Signature	Date
City/State where this Agreement was signed	
Employer	
Position and Responsibilities	Permanent Address