# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION OF OREGON DOCKET NO. UM 1191

# QWEST CORPORATION

Complainant,

# QWEST'S MOTION TO DISMISS DEFENDANT'S COUNTERCLAIM

v.

CENTRAL ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC.,

Defendant.

Under Oregon law, a counterclaim must contain all the elements necessary for a cause of action, and it must set forth a cause of action. It must be complete in itself and show that the counterclaimant is entitled to recover from the plaintiff if an action had been instituted for that purpose. *Chance v. Carter*, 81 Or. 229, 239, 158 P. 947 (1916) (judgment of nonsuit appropriate because counterclaim "does not, strictly speaking, set forth a cause of action"); *see Hammer v. Campbell Gas Burner Co.*, 74 Or. 126, 135, 144 P. 396 (1914) (counterclaim must have same particularity that would be required in complaint); *LeClare v. Thibault*, 41 Or. 601, 608, 69 P. 552 (1902) ("An answer setting up a counterclaim must contain the substantial requisites of a complaint, and allege facts which legally entitle the defendant to recover in a suit instituted by him for that purpose against the plaintiff . . .."). Under ORCP 18, a counterclaim must contain a plain and concise statement of the ultimate facts constituting a claim for relief, and it must demand specific relief.

Pursuant to OAR 860-011-0000(3) and ORCP 21A(8), Qwest moves to dismiss CEC's "counterclaim" for failure to state a claim for relief. Although CEC purports to assert a counterclaim in its Answer, there is no claim asserted. Paragraphs 2 through 16 simply make allegations, and CEC does not even bother to attach a label to its alleged claim or otherwise set

#### 1- MOTION TO DISMISS COUNTERCLAIM

forth the purported claim that it asserts. There is no allegation that Qwest violated any statute,

regulation, or contract provision because Qwest has not violated any statute, regulation, or

contract provision. Neither Qwest nor the Commission is required to guess at the cause of action

purportedly asserted by CEC. Under well-established Oregon law and ORCP 18, CEC's

"counterclaim" is fatally defective and should be dismissed.

DATED: February \_\_\_\_, 2005.

# PERKINS COIE LLP

By

Lawrence H. Reichman, OSB No. 86083 John P. (Jay) Nusbaum, OSB No. 96378 Tel: 503-727-2000 Fax: 503-727-2222

Leslie Kelly (to be admitted pro hac vice) Qwest Communications International Inc. 1801 California Street Denver, CO 80202

Attorneys for Complainant Qwest Corporation

# 2- MOTION TO DISMISS COUNTERCLAIM

Perkins Coie LLP 1120 NW Couch Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor Portland, OR 97209-4128 Phone: (503) 727-2000 Fax: (503) 727-2222

# AMENDED CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on February 10, 2005 I served the foregoing **Qwest's Motion to Dismiss** on the following person by causing to be emailed and mailed a full, true and correct copy thereof contained in a sealed envelope with postage prepaid addressed to said to person at the following addresses and deposited in the post office at Portland, Oregon:

Martin Hansen Francis, Hansen & Martin, LLP 1148 N.W. Hill Street Bend, OR 97701-1914

I hereby certify that on February 18, 2005 I served the foregoing **Qwest's Motion to Dismiss** by causing a full, true, and correct copy thereof contained in a sealed envelope with postage prepaid addressed to said to persons at the following addresses and deposited in the post office at Portland, Oregon:

Brooks Harlow Miller Nash LLP 601 Union St., Ste. 4400 Seattle, WA 98101-2352

Michael T. Weirich Department Of Justice Regulated Utility & Business Section 1162 Court St. N.E. Salem, OR 97301-4096

DATED: February 1, 2005.

Amy Tykeson Bend Cable Communications, Inc. 63090 Sherman Rd. Bend, OR 97701

Roger Harris Crestview Cable Communications 125 South Fir Street Medford, OR 97501

PERKINS COIE LLP

By

Lawrence H. Reichman, OSB No. 86083 John P. (Jay) Nusbaum, OSB No. 96378 Telephone: (503) 727-2000

Of Attorneys for Claimant

# PAGE 1 - AMENDED CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

# CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE UM 1191

I hereby certify that on this day I served the foregoing **Amended Certificate of Service** on the following persons by causing to be mailed a true copy thereof, contained in a sealed envelope, with postage prepaid, addressed to said persons at the following addresses and deposited in the post office at Portland, Oregon, on this day:

MARTIN HANSEN FRANCIS HANSEN & MARTIN, LLP 1148 NW HILL ST BEND OR 97701-1914

BROOKS HARLOW MILLER NASH LLP 601 UNION ST., STE. 4400 SEATTLE, WA 98101-2352

AMY TYKESON BEND CABLE COMMUNICATIONS, INC. 63090 SHERMAN RD. BEND, OR 97701

DATED: February \_/8, 2005.

PERKINS COIE LLP

Bν Lawrence H. Reichman, OSB No. 86083

John P. (Jay) Nusbaum, OSB No. 96073

MICHAEL T. WEIRICH

1162 COURT ST. N.E.

**CRESTVIEW CABLE** 

COMMUNICATIONS

MEDFORD, OR 97501

**125 SOUTH FIR STREET** 

**ROGER HARRIS** 

SALEM, OR 97301-4096

DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

**REGULATED UTILITY & BUS. SECTION** 

Attorneys for Qwest Corporation

#### PAGE 1- CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE