

825 NE Multnomah, Suite 2000 Portland, Oregon 97232

December 5, 2018

VIA ELECTRONIC FILING AND OVERNIGHT DELIVERY

Public Utility Commission of Oregon 201 High Street SE, Suite 100 Salem, OR 97301-3398

Attn: Filing Center

RE: LC 70—Compliance Filing

In accordance with Public Utility Commission of Oregon (Commission) Order No. 18-360 PacifiCorp d/b/a Pacific Power provides the enclosed study results and supporting materials of the updated coal analysis, presented at the December 3-4, 2018 public input meeting. The enclosed material is provided two days before the Oregon-specific stakeholder workshop that will be held on December 7, 2018.

Confidential material has been provided under Order No. 18-216.

Please direct any questions or inquiries regarding this filing to Natasha Siores at (503) 813-6583.

Sincerely,

Etta Lockey

Vice President, Regulation

Enclosure

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that I filed a true and correct copy of PacifiCorp's **Compliance Filing** on the parties listed below via email and overnight delivery in compliance with OAR 860-001-0180.

GAIL CARBIENER	
mcgccarb@bendbroadband.com	P O BOX 1088
mogoodib@bendbroddbdhd.com	SALEM OR 97308
	anna.kim@state.or.us
ALLIANCE OF WESTERN ENERGY CONS	UMERS
TYLER C PEPPLE (C)	BRADLEY MULLINS (C)
DAVISON VAN CLEVE	MOUNTAIN WEST ANALYTICS
1750 SW HARBOR WAY STE 450	1750 SW HARBOR WAY STE 450
PORTLAND, OR 97204	PORTLAND, OR 97201
	brmullins@mwanalylics.com
PATRICK J OSHIE (C)	
DAVISON VAN CLEVE PC	
507 BALLARD RD.	
ZILLAH WA 98953	
pjo@dvclaw.com	
COALITION	
MARIE P BARLOW	JOHN LOWE
SANGER LAW PC	RENEWABLE ENERGY COALITION
1117 SE 53RD AVE	12050 SW TREMONT ST
PORTLAND OR 97215	PORTLAND OR 97225-5430
marie@sanger-law.com	
irion@sanger-law.com	
inon(@.5anger-law.com	
NATIONAL GRID	1
NATHAN SANDVIG	MONICA SCHWEBS
NATIONAL GRID USA	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP
205 SE SPOKANE ST, STE 300	
FURILAND OR 97202	SPEAR STREET TOWER
nathan.sandvig@nationalgrid.com	SPEAR STREET TOWER SAN FRANCISCO CA 94105

Service List LC 70

JACK STODDARD	
MORGAN LEWIS & BOCKIUS	
ONE MARKET	
SPEAR STREET TOWER	
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94105	
fiackson stoddard@morganlewis.com	
<u>Hackson.stoudard@morganicwis.com</u>	
NW ENERGY COALITION	
WENDY GERLITZ (C)	FRED HEUTTE (C)
NW ENERGY COALITION	NW ENERGY COALITION
1205 SE FLAVEL	PO BOX 40308
PORTLAND, OR 97202	PORTLAND, OR 97240-0308
wendy@nwenergy.org	fred@nwenergy.org
OREGON CITIZENS LITILITY BOARD	
610 SW BROADWAY STE 400	OREGON CITIZENS' LITILITY BOARD
PORTLAND OR 97205	610 SW BROADWAY STE 400
dockets@oregoncub.org	PORTLAND OR 97205
	mike@oregoncub.org
ROBERT JENKS (C)	
OREGON CITIZENS' UTILITY BOARD	
610 SW BROADWAY, STE 400	
PORTLAND OR 97205	
bob@oregoncub.org	
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY	
PATRICK ROWE (C)	
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NF
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doi.state.or.us	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sjerman@state.or.us
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C)	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301 wendy.simons@oregon.gov	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301 wendy.simons@oregon.gov PACIFICORP	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301 wendy.simons@oregon.gov PACIFICORP ETTA LOCKEY (C)	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301 wendy.simons@oregon.gov PACIFICORP ETTA LOCKEY (C) PACIFIC POWER	MATTHEW MCVEE (C) PACIFIC POWER
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301 wendy.simons@oregon.gov PACIFICORP ETTA LOCKEY (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH ST., STE 2000	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us MATTHEW MCVEE (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH STE 1800
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301 wendy.simons@oregon.gov PACIFICORP ETTA LOCKEY (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH ST., STE 2000 PORTLAND, OR 97232	MATTHEW MCVEE (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH STE 1800 PORTLAND, OR 97232
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301 wendy.simons@oregon.gov PACIFICORP ETTA LOCKEY (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH ST., STE 2000 PORTLAND, OR 97232 etta.lockey@pacificorp.com	MATTHEW MCVEE (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH STE 1800 PORTLAND, OR 97232 matthew.mcvee@pacificorp.com
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301 wendy.simons@oregon.gov PACIFICORP ETTA LOCKEY (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH ST., STE 2000 PORTLAND, OR 97232 etta.lockey@pacificorp.com	MATTHEW MCVEE (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH STE 1800 PORTLAND, OR 97232 matthew.mcvee@pacificorp.com
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301 wendy.simons@oregon.gov PACIFICORP ETTA LOCKEY (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH ST., STE 2000 PORTLAND, OR 97232 etta.lockey@pacificorp.com PACIFICORP, DBA PACIFIC POWER	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us MATTHEW MCVEE (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH STE 1800 PORTLAND, OR 97232 matthew.mcvee@pacificorp.com
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301 wendy.simons@oregon.gov PACIFICORP ETTA LOCKEY (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH ST., STE 2000 PORTLAND, OR 97232 etta.lockey@pacificorp.com PACIFICORP, DBA PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH ST, STE 2000 PORTLORP, DBA PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH ST, STE 2000	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us MATTHEW MCVEE (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH STE 1800 PORTLAND, OR 97232 matthew.mcvee@pacificorp.com
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301 wendy.simons@oregon.gov PACIFICORP ETTA LOCKEY (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH ST., STE 2000 PORTLAND, OR 97232 etta.lockey@pacificorp.com PACIFICORP, DBA PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH ST, STE 2000 PORTLAND, OR 97232	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us MATTHEW MCVEE (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH STE 1800 PORTLAND, OR 97232 matthew.mcvee@pacificorp.com
OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301 patrick.g.rowe@doj.state.or.us WENDY SIMONS (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 550 CAPITOL ST NE 1ST FL SALEM OR 97301 wendy.simons@oregon.gov PACIFICORP ETTA LOCKEY (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH ST., STE 2000 PORTLAND, OR 97232 etta.lockey@pacificorp.com PACIFICORP, DBA PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH ST, STE 2000 PORTLAND, OR 97232 oregondockets@pacificorp.com	JASON SIERMAN (C) OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301 jason.sierman@state.or.us MATTHEW MCVEE (C) PACIFIC POWER 825 NE MULTNOMAH STE 1800 PORTLAND, OR 97232 matthew.mcvee@pacificorp.com

PORTLAND GENERAL ELECTRIC	
ERIN APPERSON	ELAINE HART
PORTLAND GENERAL ELECTRIC	PORTLAND GENERAL ELECTRIC
121 SW SALMON ST - 1WTC1711	121 SW SALMON ST - 1WTC1711
PORTI AND OR 97204	PORTI AND OR 97204
erin apperson@pan.com	elaine bart@pan.com
	elaine.hait@pgn.com
JAY TINKER	
PORTLAND GENERAL ELECTRIC	
121 SW SALMON ST 1WTC-0306	
PORTLAND OR 97204	
nge opuc filings@pan.com	
RENEWABLE NW	-
SILVIA TANNER (C)	MICHAEL O'BRIEN (C)
RENEWABLE NORTHWEST	RENEWABLE NORTHWEST
421 SW 6TH AVE. STE 975	421 SW 6TH AVENUE STE, 975
PORTLAND OR 97204	PORTLAND OR 97204
silvia@renewablenw.org	michael@renewablenw.org
<u>simal@renewabienw.org</u>	michael@renewablenw.org
RENEWABLE NORTHWEST	
421 SW 6TH AVE., STE, 975	
PORTLAND OR 97204	
dockets@renewablenw.org	
SIERRA CLUB	
ANA BOYD (C)	GLORIA D SMITH (C)
SIERRA CLUB	SIERRA CLUB LAW PROGRAM
2101 WEBSTER ST STE 1300	2101 WEBSTER ST STE 1300
OAKLAND, CA 94612	OAKLAND, CA 94612
ana boyd@sierraclub.org	gloria smith@sierraclub.org
	gioria.ormanagoloria.org
MARTA DARBY (C)	
SIERRA CLUB	
2101 WEBSTER STREET SUITE 1300	
OAKI AND CA 94612	
marta darby@sierraclub.org	
Inalta.daiby@sienacidb.olg	
STAFF	1
THOMAS FAMILIA (C)	SOMMER MOSER (C)
PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION OF	PUC STAFF - DEPÀRTMENT OF
OREGON	JUSTICE
PO BOX 1088	1162 COURT ST NE
SALEM OR 97308	SALEM OR 07301
themes familie@state or us	SALEM OK 97301
	sommer.moser(@uoj.state.or.us
JOHANNA RIEMENSCHNEIDER (C)	
PUC STAFF - DEPARTMENT OF	
JUSTICE	
1162 COURT ST NE	
SALEM OR 97301-4796	
iohanna riemenschneider@doi state or us	

STOP B2H	
NORM CIMON 2108 FIRST ST LA GRANDE OR 97850 ncimon@oregontrail.net	F. STEVEN KNUDSEN FSK ENERGY 2015 SE SALMON ST PORTLAND OR 97214 sknudsen@threeboys.com
JIM KREIDER 60366 MARVIN RD LA GRANDE OR 97850 jkreider@campblackdog.org	

Dated December 5, 2018.

Jennifer Angell Supervisor, Regulatory Operations



2019 Integrated Resource Plan (IRP) Public Input Meeting December 3-4, 2018





Agenda



December 3 – Day One

- 9:00am-11:30am pacific Coal Studies Discussion
- 11:30am-12:15pm pacific Lunch Break
- 12:15pm-4:00pm pacific Coal Studies Discussion (continued)

December 4 – Day Two

- 8:30am-11:15am pacific Coal Studies Discussion (continued)
- 11:15am-12:00pm pacific Lunch Break
- 12:00pm–3:00pm pacific Coal Studies Discussion (continued)
- 3:00pm-3:30pm pacific Stakeholder Feedback Form Recap
- 3:30pm-4:00pm pacific Wrap-Up / Next Steps



Coal Studies Overview





Overview



- As previously discussed, this set of analysis will inform PacifiCorp's long-term resource decisions, but it does not on its own determine how long specific coal units will stay in service—none of the resource portfolios that will be discussed today represent the company's preferred portfolio.
- A preliminary reliability assessment shows that portfolios in early coal-retirement cases can stress system reliability—reliability considerations will continue to be evaluated within the 2019 IRP and coal-retirement cases summarized herein may not include all of the costs required to meet reliability targets.
- PacifiCorp understands the impact of its resource decisions on its customers and communities. These and other important considerations that are not included in this analysis and must be studied before future resource decisions are made.
- In the updated coal-retirement discussion, we will cover:
 - Unit-by-unit coal retirement results.
 - Alternate-year results.
 - Stacked-retirement results.
 - Preliminary reliability-assessment findings.
 - Impact of intra-hour flexible resource credit assumptions.



- Updated unit-by-unit analysis will reflect 2019 IRP planning assumptions, consider impacts on system reliability, and be evaluated using the Planning and Risk model (PaR).
- PacifiCorp will assess alternative retirement dates for the least economic units (2022, 2025, 2028, and 2031).
- Stacked analysis will be performed on the least economic units, assuming retirement dates that are consistent those identified from the alternative retirement date studies.
- Potential economic retirements, informed by the analysis described above, will be further evaluated in the 2019 IRP portfolio development process.
- Portfolios will be developed using the System Optimizer model with base case price-policy assumptions, and cost-and-risk analysis will be performed using PaR under three different pricepolicy scenarios.
- In developing the updated coal studies, PacifiCorp developed over 40 resource portfolios that were analyzed in over 130 PaR runs.



- Initial model runs for the portfolio-development process will consider the interplay of Regional Haze compliance alternatives with potential economic coal unit retirements while evaluating near-term coal unit decisions (*i.e.*, Naughton 3, Jim Bridger 1 and 2), updating analysis from the 2017 IRP (*i.e.*, Cholla 4), and incorporating commission-ordered analysis (*i.e.*, Colstrip 3 and 4).
- Additional portfolio will be developed, using coal retirement assumptions that can meet compliance obligations and that minimize system costs, using alternative assumptions for other system variables (*i.e.*, CO₂ policies, market prices, FOT availability, Energy Gateway, and DSM).
- Once initial model results are available, additional portfolios may be developed.
- Cost-and-risk analysis will be performed using PaR under three different price-policy scenarios.



Unit-by-Unit Summary Results





Unit-by-Unit Rankings (Without Intra-Hour Flexible Resource Credit)



*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

POWERING YOUR GREATNESS

8

System Optimizer Unit-by-Unit Results (Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR (\$m)	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement
C-01 (Benchmark)	\$21,897	n/a	n/a
C-02 (Colstrip 3)	\$21,906	\$9m	\$17/kW-yr
C-03 (Colstrip 4)	\$21,902	\$5m	\$10/kW-yr
C-04 (Craig 1)	\$21,897	(\$0m)	(\$2/kW-yr)
C-05 (Craig 2)	\$21,875	(\$22m)	(\$45/kW-yr)
C-06 (Dave Johnston 1)	\$21,903	\$6m	\$17/kW-yr
C-07 (Dave Johnston 2)	\$21,905	\$8m	\$24/kW-yr
C-08 (Dave Johnston 3)	\$21,895	(\$2m)	(\$3/kW-yr)
C-09 (Dave Johnston 4)	\$21,916	\$19m	\$18/kW-yr
C-10 (Hayden 1)	\$21,885	(\$12m)	(\$60/kW-yr)
C-11 (Hayden 2)	\$21,893	(\$4m)	(\$28/kW-yr)
C-12 (Hunter 1)	\$21,816	(\$81m)	(\$27/kW-yr)
C-13 (Hunter 2)	\$21,878	(\$19m)	(\$10/kW-yr)
C-14 (Hunter 3)	\$21,853	(\$44m)	(\$13/kW-yr)
C-15 (Huntington 1)	\$21,808	(\$89m)	(\$29/kW-yr)
C-16 (Huntington 2)	\$21,794	(\$103m)	(\$34/kW-yr)
C-17 (Jim Bridger 1)	\$21,690	(\$207m)	(\$84/kW-yr)
C-18 (Jim Bridger 2)	\$21,748	(\$149m)	(\$59/kW-yr)
C-19 (Jim Bridger 3)	\$21,800	(\$97m)	(\$40/kW-yr)
C-20 (Jim Bridger 4)	\$21,797	(\$100m)	(\$40/kW-yr)
C-21 (Naughton 1)	\$21,794	(\$102m)	(\$159/kW-yr)
C-22 (Naughton 2)	\$21,801	(\$96m)	(\$115/kW-yr)
C-23 (Wyodak)	\$21,880	(\$17m)	(\$8/kW-yr)

9

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

PaR Unit-by-Unit Results (Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR (\$m)	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement
C-01 (Benchmark)	\$23,310	n/a	n/a
C-02 (Colstrip 3)	\$23,317	\$7	\$12/kW-yr
C-03 (Colstrip 4)	\$23,302	(\$8)	(\$14/kW-yr)
C-04 (Craig 1)	\$23,304	(\$6)	(\$38/kW-yr)
C-05 (Craig 2)	\$23,281	(\$29)	(\$60/kW-yr)
C-06 (Dave Johnston 1)	\$23,305	(\$5)	(\$16/kW-yr)
C-07 (Dave Johnston 2)	\$23,363	\$53	\$160/kW-yr
C-08 (Dave Johnston 3)	\$23,273	(\$37)	(\$53/kW-yr)
C-09 (Dave Johnston 4)	\$23,304	(\$6)	(\$6/kW-yr)
C-10 (Hayden 1)	\$23,252	(\$58)	(\$290/kW-yr)
C-11 (Hayden 2)	\$23,287	(\$23)	(\$150/kW-yr)
C-12 (Hunter 1)	\$23,341	\$31	\$10/kW-yr
C-13 (Hunter 2)	\$23,334	\$24	\$12/kW-yr
C-14 (Hunter 3)	\$23,438	\$128	\$37/kW-yr
C-15 (Huntington 1)	\$23,326	\$17	\$5/kW-yr
C-16 (Huntington 2)	\$23,310	\$0	\$0/kW-yr
C-17 (Jim Bridger 1)	\$23,197	(\$113)	(\$46/kW-yr)
C-18 (Jim Bridger 2)	\$23,257	(\$53)	(\$21/kW-yr)
C-19 (Jim Bridger 3)	\$23,283	(\$27)	(\$11/kW-yr)
C-20 (Jim Bridger 4)	\$23,349	\$39	\$16/kW-yr
C-21 (Naughton 1)	\$23,187	(\$123)	(\$190/kW-yr)
C-22 (Naughton 2)	\$23,212	(\$98)	(\$118/kW-yr)
C-23 (Wyodak)	\$23,323	\$13	\$7/kW-yr

10

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

PaR Unit-by-Unit Results (High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR (\$m)	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement
C-01 (Benchmark)	\$28,176	n/a	n/a
C-02 (Colstrip 3)	\$28,152	(\$25)	(\$46/kW-yr)
C-03 (Colstrip 4)	\$28,145	(\$31)	(\$57/kW-yr)
C-04 (Craig 1)	\$28,265	\$89	\$538/kW-yr
C-05 (Craig 2)	\$28,214	\$37	\$78/kW-yr
C-06 (Dave Johnston 1)	\$28,225	\$48	\$145/kW-yr
C-07 (Dave Johnston 2)	\$28,205	\$28	\$85/kW-yr
C-08 (Dave Johnston 3)	\$28,275	\$98	\$142/kW-yr
C-09 (Dave Johnston 4)	\$28,234	\$58	\$55/kW-yr
C-10 (Hayden 1)	\$28,167	(\$9)	(\$47/kW-yr)
C-11 (Hayden 2)	\$28,203	\$26	\$174/kW-yr
C-12 (Hunter 1)	\$28,258	\$81	\$27/kW-yr
C-13 (Hunter 2)	\$28,255	\$79	\$40/kW-yr
C-14 (Hunter 3)	\$28,297	\$121	\$35/kW-yr
C-15 (Huntington 1)	\$28,215	\$38	\$12/kW-yr
C-16 (Huntington 2)	\$28,172	(\$4)	(\$1/kW-yr)
C-17 (Jim Bridger 1)	\$28,107	(\$69)	(\$28/kW-yr)
C-18 (Jim Bridger 2)	\$28,183	\$7	\$3/kW-yr
C-19 (Jim Bridger 3)	\$28,123	(\$53)	(\$22/kW-yr)
C-20 (Jim Bridger 4)	\$28,156	(\$20)	(\$8/kW-yr)
C-21 (Naughton 1)	\$28,110	(\$66)	(\$103/kW-yr)
C-22 (Naughton 2)	\$28,134	(\$42)	(\$51/kW-yr)
C-23 (Wyodak)	\$28,434	\$258	\$133/kW-yr

11

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

PaR Unit-by-Unit Results (Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR (\$m)	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement
C-01 (Benchmark)	\$19,644	n/a	n/a
C-02 (Colstrip 3)	\$19,701	\$57	\$106
C-03 (Colstrip 4)	\$19,678	\$35	\$64
C-04 (Craig 1)	\$19,579	(\$64)	(\$389)
C-05 (Craig 2)	\$19,513	(\$131)	(\$271)
C-06 (Dave Johnston 1)	\$19,601	(\$42)	(\$127)
C-07 (Dave Johnston 2)	\$19,572	(\$71)	(\$213)
C-08 (Dave Johnston 3)	\$19,554	(\$89)	(\$129)
C-09 (Dave Johnston 4)	\$19,581	(\$62)	(\$60)
C-10 (Hayden 1)	\$19,553	(\$91)	(\$452)
C-11 (Hayden 2)	\$19,596	(\$48)	(\$317)
C-12 (Hunter 1)	\$19,675	\$31	\$10
C-13 (Hunter 2)	\$19,658	\$14	\$7
C-14 (Hunter 3)	\$19,796	\$153	\$45
C-15 (Huntington 1)	\$19,670	\$26	\$8
C-16 (Huntington 2)	\$19,696	\$53	\$17
C-17 (Jim Bridger 1)	\$19,504	(\$140)	(\$56)
C-18 (Jim Bridger 2)	\$19,537	(\$106)	(\$42)
C-19 (Jim Bridger 3)	\$19,642	(\$2)	(\$1)
C-20 (Jim Bridger 4)	\$19,578	(\$65)	(\$26)
C-21 (Naughton 1)	\$19,486	(\$157)	(\$244)
C-22 (Naughton 2)	\$19,488	(\$156)	(\$187)
C-23 (Wyodak)	\$19,746	\$103	\$53

12

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Conclusions from Unit-by-Unit Summary Results



- To ensure studies were prepared in advance of this meeting, PacifiCorp selected units for further alternate-year cases based on SO model results (before PaR studies were completed)—these results are summarized later in the presentation:
 - Naughton 1
 - Naughton 2
 - Jim Bridger 1
 - Hayden 1
- As base/base PaR runs became available, PacifiCorp selected the following units to analyzed in its stacked-retirement cases—these results are also summarized later in this presentation:
 - Hayden 1
 - Naughton 1
 - Hayden 2
 - Naughton 2
 - Craig 2
 - Dave Johnston 3
 - Jim Bridger 1
 - Craig 1
 - Jim Bridger 2
- Detailed unit-by-unit results for those units analyzed in stacked-retirement cases are summarized in the following section.



Unit-by-Unit Detailed Results





Benchmark Case (C-01) Resource Portfolio



Benchmark Case (C-01) Transmission Upgrades



Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Nominal Capital (\$m)
2024	UT South	UT South	UT South	0	300	\$8.6
2025	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	0	405	\$3.1
2025	Southern OR	Southern OR	Southern OR	0	975	\$85.2
2026	UT South	UT South	UT South	0	800	\$188.0
2026	SW WY	SW WY	SW WY	0	100	\$9.0
2030	Goshen ID	Goshen ID	UT North	800	1,100	\$253.7
2032	Aeolus	Aeolus	UT South	1,500	1,850	\$2,319.2
2035	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	\$249.2
2037	Portland/N.C. OR	Portland/N.C. OR	Willamette V. OR	450	580	\$322.0
2037	UT North	UT North	UT North	0	500	\$50.9
2037	SW WY	SW WY	SW WY	0	500	\$38.8
2038	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	0	615	\$41.2
					Total	\$3,568.9

Hayden 1 Case (C-10) Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Delayed from 2032 to 2033	Aeolus	Aeolus	UT South	1,500	1,850	\$52.9
Accelerated from 2035 to 2033	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	(\$11)
Accelerated from 2038 to 2037	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	0	615	(\$0.9)
					Total	\$41.0

17

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Hayden 1 Case (C-10) (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$19)	(\$30.21)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$31)	(\$48.66)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	(\$8)	(\$12.52)
Decommissioning	\$0	\$0.08
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$57)	(\$91.31)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$78	\$123.70
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$53)	(\$85.13)
Variable O&M	\$5	\$7.83
Emissions	\$40	\$63.18
Demand-Side Management	(\$1)	(\$1.54)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$5)	(\$7.57)
Market Purchases	\$14	\$23.07
Market Sales	(\$41)	(\$64.79)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$0	\$0.14
Transmission Upgrades	(\$38)	(\$60.67)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	(\$1)	(\$1.81)
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$58)	(\$93.12)

18

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Hayden 1 Case (C-10) (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$19)	(\$30.11)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$31)	(\$48.56)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	(\$11)	(\$17.40)
Decommissioning	\$0	\$0.08
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$60)	(\$95.99)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$81	\$128.80
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$53)	(\$84.81)
Variable O&M	\$5	\$7.28
Emissions	\$65	\$103.71
Demand-Side Management	(\$1)	(\$1.57)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$5)	(\$7.46)
Market Purchases	\$21	\$33.22
Market Sales	(\$27)	(\$43.51)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$4	\$5.98
Transmission Upgrades	(\$38)	(\$60.55)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$51	\$81.09
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$9)	(\$0.71)

19

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Hayden 1 Case (C-10) (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$16)	(\$29.73)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$31)	(\$55.52)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00
Decommissioning	\$0	\$0.09
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$47)	(\$85.17)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$64	\$115.65
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$53)	(\$96.98)
Variable O&M	\$5	\$8.97
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00
Demand-Side Management	(\$1)	(\$1.66)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$5)	(\$8.72)
Market Purchases	\$6	\$11.69
Market Sales	(\$23)	(\$42.11)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$1	\$2.52
Transmission Upgrades	(\$38)	(\$69.23)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	(\$44)	(\$79.87)
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$91)	(\$165.04)

20

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Naughton 1 Case (C-21) Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Delayed from 2032 to 2033	Aeolus	Aeolus	UT South	1,500	1,850	\$52.9
Accelerated from 2035 to 2033	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	(\$11)
					Total	\$41.9

21 *Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Naughton 1 Case (C-21) (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$58)	(\$30.88)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$98)	(\$51.97)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	(\$17)	(\$8.86)
Decommissioning	\$3	\$1.81
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$170)	(\$89.91)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$98	\$51.63
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$64)	(\$33.98)
Variable O&M	\$5	\$2.74
Emissions	\$44	\$23.09
Demand-Side Management	(\$3)	(\$1.61)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$4)	(\$2.29)
Market Purchases	\$42	\$22.28
Market Sales	(\$43)	(\$22.49)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$12	\$6.23
Transmission Upgrades	(\$39)	(\$20.46)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$48	\$25.14
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$123)	(\$64.77)

22

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Naughton 1 Case (C-21) (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$77)	(\$29.57)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$98)	(\$37.67)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	(\$43)	(\$16.62)
Decommissioning	\$3	\$1.28
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$216)	(\$82.59)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$130	\$49.78
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$64)	(\$24.59)
Variable O&M	\$5	\$2.04
Emissions	\$76	\$28.97
Demand-Side Management	(\$3)	(\$1.19)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$4)	(\$1.61)
Market Purchases	\$55	\$21.23
Market Sales	(\$20)	(\$7.53)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$13	\$4.92
Transmission Upgrades	(\$39)	(\$14.83)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$149	\$57.18
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$66)	(\$25.41)

23

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Naughton 1 Case (C-21) (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$38)	(\$33.83)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$98)	(\$87.20)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00
Decommissioning	\$3	\$2.96
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$133)	(\$118.07)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$73	\$64.69
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$64)	(\$56.92)
Variable O&M	\$5	\$4.28
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00
Demand-Side Management	(\$1)	(\$0.74)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$4)	(\$3.92)
Market Purchases	\$22	\$19.67
Market Sales	(\$29)	(\$25.87)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$13	\$11.53
Transmission Upgrades	(\$39)	(\$34.33)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	(\$24)	(\$21.62)
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$157)	(\$139.68)

24

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Hayden 2 Case (C-11) Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Delayed from 2032 to 2033	Aeolus	Aeolus	UT South	1,500	1,850	\$52.9
Added in 2033	Walla Walla WA	Walla Walla WA	Yakima WA	200	100	\$74.8
Accelerated from 2035 to 2033	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	(\$11)
Accelerated from 2038 to 2037	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	0	615	(\$0.9)
					Total	\$115.8

25

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Hayden 2 Case (C-11) (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$18)	(\$28.91)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$20)	(\$32.78)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	(\$7)	(\$11.47)
Decommissioning	\$0	\$0.06
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$45)	(\$73.10)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$76	\$122.63
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$33)	(\$53.78)
Variable O&M	\$4	\$6.32
Emissions	\$39	\$62.37
Demand-Side Management	(\$1)	(\$2.35)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$2)	(\$3.75)
Market Purchases	\$14	\$22.56
Market Sales	(\$46)	(\$74.47)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$4	\$5.89
Transmission Upgrades	(\$30)	(\$49.08)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$22	\$36.34
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$23)	(\$36.76)

26

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Hayden 2 Case (C-11) (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$18)	(\$28.76)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$20)	(\$31.84)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	(\$12)	(\$19.01)
Decommissioning	\$0	\$0.06
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$51)	(\$79.55)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$76	\$119.98
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$30)	(\$46.63)
Variable O&M	\$4	\$5.61
Emissions	\$64	\$99.78
Demand-Side Management	(\$1)	(\$2.33)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$2)	(\$3.55)
Market Purchases	\$20	\$31.71
Market Sales	(\$29)	(\$45.28)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$6	\$9.33
Transmission Upgrades	(\$30)	(\$47.66)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$77	\$120.95
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	\$26	\$41.40

27

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Hayden 2 Case (C-11) (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$15)	(\$28.59)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$20)	(\$38.26)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00
Decommissioning	\$0	\$0.07
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$35)	(\$66.78)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$62	\$117.80
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$30)	(\$56.04)
Variable O&M	\$4	\$7.36
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00
Demand-Side Management	(\$1)	(\$2.65)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$2)	(\$4.46)
Market Purchases	\$6	\$12.20
Market Sales	(\$27)	(\$50.15)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$5	\$9.47
Transmission Upgrades	(\$30)	(\$57.28)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	(\$13)	(\$23.74)
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$48)	(\$90.53)

28

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Naughton 2 Case (C-22) Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Delayed from 2032 to 2033	Aeolus	Aeolus	UT South	1,500	1,850	\$52.9
					Total	\$52.9

Naughton 2 Case (C-22) (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$48)	(\$36.21)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$108)	(\$82.02)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	(\$13)	(\$10.25)
Decommissioning	\$4	\$3.27
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$164)	(\$125.20)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$59	\$45.13
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$76)	(\$58.03)
Variable O&M	\$5	\$3.86
Emissions	\$27	\$20.44
Demand-Side Management	(\$3)	(\$2.38)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$5)	(\$3.52)
Market Purchases	\$47	\$35.42
Market Sales	\$44	\$33.50
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$16	\$12.37
Transmission Upgrades	(\$48)	(\$36.29)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$66	\$50.50
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$98)	(\$74.70)

30

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Naughton 2 Case (C-22) (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$70)	(\$33.87)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$108)	(\$52.21)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	(\$34)	(\$16.65)
Decommissioning	\$4	\$2.08
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$208)	(\$100.65)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$100	\$48.65
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$76)	(\$36.90)
Variable O&M	\$6	\$2.80
Emissions	\$51	\$24.64
Demand-Side Management	(\$3)	(\$1.63)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$5)	(\$2.19)
Market Purchases	\$63	\$30.64
Market Sales	\$60	\$29.09
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$17	\$8.16
Transmission Upgrades	(\$48)	(\$23.10)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$165	\$80.15
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$42)	(\$20.49)

31

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.
Naughton 2 Case (C-22) (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$29)	(\$42.52)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$108)	(\$160.10)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00
Decommissioning	\$4	\$6.39
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$132)	(\$196.23)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$40	\$58.82
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$76)	(\$113.15)
Variable O&M	\$5	\$7.09
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00
Demand-Side Management	(\$3)	(\$4.54)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$5)	(\$6.98)
Market Purchases	\$25	\$36.50
Market Sales	\$22	\$32.56
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$17	\$25.41
Transmission Upgrades	(\$48)	(\$70.84)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	(\$24)	(\$35.13)
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$156)	(\$231.36)

32

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Craig 2 Case (C-05) Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Delayed from 2032 to 2033	Aeolus	Aeolus	UT South	1,500	1,850	\$52.9
Delayed from 2035 to 2036	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	\$5.7
Accelerated from 2038 to 2037	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	0	615	(\$0.9)
Removed in 2037	Portland/N.C. OR	Portland/N.C. OR	Willamette V. OR	450	580	(\$322.0)
					Total	(\$264.4)

33

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Craig 2 Case (C-05) (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$78)	(\$25.36)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$83)	(\$27.13)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	(\$41)	(\$13.51)
Decommissioning	\$0	\$0.11
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$202)	(\$65.89)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$94	\$30.69
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$127)	(\$41.50)
Variable O&M	\$10	\$3.13
Emissions	\$36	\$11.70
Demand-Side Management	(\$5)	(\$1.64)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$12)	(\$3.84)
Market Purchases	\$25	\$8.17
Market Sales	\$206	\$67.28
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$7	\$2.23
Transmission Upgrades	(\$61)	(\$19.75)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$173	\$56.47
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$29)	(\$9.42)

34

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Craig 2 Case (C-05) (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$69)	(\$25.29)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$83)	(\$30.59)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	(\$71)	(\$26.17)
Decommissioning	\$0	\$0.13
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$223)	(\$81.92)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$122	\$44.71
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$127)	(\$46.77)
Variable O&M	\$10	\$3.52
Emissions	\$72	\$26.53
Demand-Side Management	(\$5)	(\$1.85)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$12)	(\$4.31)
Market Purchases	\$40	\$14.74
Market Sales	\$216	\$79.28
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$6	\$2.10
Transmission Upgrades	(\$61)	(\$22.27)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$260	\$95.69
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	\$37	\$13.78

35

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Craig 2 Case (C-05) (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$81)	(\$25.55)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$83)	(\$26.30)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00
Decommissioning	\$0	\$0.11
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$164)	(\$51.74)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$65	\$20.44
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$127)	(\$40.20)
Variable O&M	\$9	\$2.92
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00
Demand-Side Management	(\$5)	(\$1.59)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$12)	(\$3.73)
Market Purchases	\$10	\$3.26
Market Sales	\$147	\$46.38
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$6	\$2.01
Transmission Upgrades	(\$61)	(\$19.14)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$33	\$10.36
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$131)	(\$41.38)

36

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Dave Johnston 3 Case (C-08) Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Delayed from 2032 to 2033	Aeolus	Aeolus	UT South	1,500	1,850	\$52.9
Accelerated from 2035 to 2034	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	(\$5.6)
					Total	\$47.3

37 *Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Dave Johnston 3 Case (C-08) (PaR Base/Base Scenario)

Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$72)	(\$14.31)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$80)	(\$15.92)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	(\$38)	(\$7.47)
Decommissioning	\$1	\$0.12
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$189)	(\$37.59)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$163	\$32.45
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$54)	(\$10.72)
Variable O&M	\$7	\$1.40
Emissions	\$56	\$11.14
Demand-Side Management	\$0	\$0.03
Long-Term Contracts	(\$5)	(\$0.97)
Market Purchases	\$30	\$5.97
Market Sales	(\$13)	(\$2.67)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$12	\$2.29
Transmission Upgrades	(\$43)	(\$8.59)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$153	\$30.32
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$37)	(\$7.27)

38

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Dave Johnston 3 Case (C-08) (PaR High/High Scenario)

Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$71)	(\$14.31)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$80)	(\$16.17)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	(\$82)	(\$16.48)
Decommissioning	\$1	\$0.12
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$232)	(\$46.84)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$179	\$36.19
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$54)	(\$10.89)
Variable O&M	\$7	\$1.37
Emissions	\$74	\$14.99
Demand-Side Management	(\$0)	(\$0.04)
Long-Term Contracts	(\$5)	(\$0.99)
Market Purchases	\$16	\$3.26
Market Sales	\$143	\$28.82
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$13	\$2.66
Transmission Upgrades	(\$43)	(\$8.73)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$330	\$66.63
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	\$98	\$19.79

39

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

POWERING YOUR GREATNESS

Dave Johnston 3 Case (C-08) (PaR Low/None Scenario)

Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$72)	(\$14.32)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$80)	(\$15.92)
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00
Decommissioning	\$1	\$0.12
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$152)	(\$30.12)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$136	\$26.92
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$54)	(\$10.71)
Variable O&M	\$6	\$1.26
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00
Demand-Side Management	\$0	\$0.07
Long-Term Contracts	(\$5)	(\$0.98)
Market Purchases	\$20	\$3.91
Market Sales	(\$9)	(\$1.75)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$12	\$2.32
Transmission Upgrades	(\$43)	(\$8.59)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$63	\$12.43
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$89)	(\$17.69)

40

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

POWERING YOUR GREATNESS

Jim Bridger 1 Case (C-17) Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Delayed from 2032 to 2033	Aeolus	Aeolus	UT South	1,500	1,850	\$52.9
Accelerated from 2035 to 2033	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	(\$11.0)
Accelerated from 2037 to 2033	SW WY	SW WY	SW WY	0	500	(\$3.3)
Accelerated from 2038 to 2037	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	0	615	(\$0.9)
					Total	\$37.6

41

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Jim Bridger 1 Case (C-17) (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$217)	(\$31.40)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$363)	(\$52.57)
Variable O&M	(\$3)	(\$0.48)
Emissions	(\$119)	(\$17.26)
Decommissioning	\$5	\$0.77
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$696)	(\$100.94)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$255	\$36.94
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$149	\$21.58
Variable O&M	\$15	\$2.11
Emissions	\$78	\$11.28
Demand-Side Management	\$33	\$4.79
Long-Term Contracts	\$1	\$0.13
Market Purchases	\$75	\$10.88
Market Sales	(\$21)	(\$3.00)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$35	\$5.03
Transmission Upgrades	(\$36)	(\$5.15)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$584	\$84.59
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$113)	(\$16.35)

42

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Jim Bridger 1 Case (C-17) (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$229)	(\$30.50)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$363)	(\$48.31)
Variable O&M	(\$4)	(\$0.48)
Emissions	(\$238)	(\$31.73)
Decommissioning	\$5	\$0.70
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$828)	(\$110.32)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$316	\$42.12
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$149	\$19.84
Variable O&M	\$13	\$1.71
Emissions	\$147	\$19.58
Demand-Side Management	\$33	\$4.41
Long-Term Contracts	\$1	\$0.16
Market Purchases	\$89	\$11.91
Market Sales	\$9	\$1.19
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$37	\$4.92
Transmission Upgrades	(\$36)	(\$4.74)
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$759	\$101.11
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$69)	(\$9.21)

43

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Jim Bridger 1 Case (C-17) (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$200)	(\$32.57)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$363)	(\$59.06)			
Variable O&M	(\$3)	(\$0.48)			
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00			
Decommissioning	\$5	\$0.85			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$560)	(\$91.25)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$189	\$30.75			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$149	\$24.26			
Variable O&M	\$13	\$2.04			
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00			
Demand-Side Management	\$33	\$5.36			
Long-Term Contracts	\$1	\$0.12			
Market Purchases	\$49	\$7.99			
Market Sales	(\$12)	(\$2.02)			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$36	\$5.82			
Transmission Upgrades	(\$36)	(\$5.79)			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$421	\$68.51			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$140)	(\$22.74)			

44

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Craig 1 Case (C-04) Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Delayed from 2032 to 2033	Aeolus	Aeolus	UT South	1,500	1,850	\$52.9
Delayed from 2035 to 2037	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	\$11.5
					Total	\$64.4

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

45

Craig 1 Case (C-04) (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$26)	(\$23.88)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$24)	(\$21.85)			
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00			
Emissions	(\$3)	(\$2.97)			
Decommissioning	\$0	\$0.10			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$53)	(\$48.61)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$60	\$55.44			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$108)	(\$99.19)			
Variable O&M	\$6	\$5.89			
Emissions	\$19	\$17.71			
Demand-Side Management	\$1	\$0.57			
Long-Term Contracts	(\$6)	(\$5.14)			
Market Purchases	\$17	\$15.41			
Market Sales	\$108	\$99.35			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$5	\$4.18			
Transmission Upgrades	(\$56)	(\$51.37)			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$47	\$42.85			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$6)	(\$5.76)			

46

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Craig 1 Case (C-04) (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)				
Cost Savings from Retired Unit	Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$26)	(\$23.87)				
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$24)	(\$21.49)				
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00				
Emissions	(\$7)	(\$6.25)				
Decommissioning	\$0	\$0.09				
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$57)	(\$51.52)				
Net Replacement Costs						
Fuel	\$72	\$64.77				
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$108)	(\$97.66)				
Variable O&M	\$6	\$5.64				
Emissions	\$41	\$36.96				
Demand-Side Management	\$1	\$0.49				
Long-Term Contracts	(\$6)	(\$4.98)				
Market Purchases	\$24	\$21.98				
Market Sales	\$169	\$152.76				
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$3	\$2.60				
Transmission Upgrades	(\$56)	(\$50.53)				
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00				
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$146	\$132.03				
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	\$89	\$80.52				

47

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Craig 1 Case (C-04) (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$22)	(\$24.03)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$24)	(\$25.50)			
Variable O&M	\$0	\$0.00			
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00			
Decommissioning	\$0	\$0.11			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$46)	(\$49.42)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$26	\$28.32			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$108)	(\$115.76)			
Variable O&M	\$5	\$5.48			
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00			
Demand-Side Management	\$1	\$0.60			
Long-Term Contracts	(\$6)	(\$5.99)			
Market Purchases	\$4	\$4.15			
Market Sales	\$112	\$120.32			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$3	\$3.23			
Transmission Upgrades	(\$56)	(\$59.95)			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	(\$18)	(\$19.59)			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$64)	(\$69.00)			

48

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Jim Bridger 2 Case (C-18) Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Delayed from 2032 to 2033	Aeolus	Aeolus	UT South	1,500	1,850	\$52.9
Accelerated from 2035 to 2033	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	(\$11.0)
Added in 2035	Walla Walla WA	Walla Walla WA	Yakima WA	200	100	\$78.3
Accelerated from 2038 to 2037	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	0	615	(\$0.9)
Accelerated from 2037 to 2033	SW WY	SW WY	SW WY	0	500	(\$3.3)
					Total	\$115.9

49

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Jim Bridger 2 Case (C-18) (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$250)	(\$28.90)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$379)	(\$43.80)			
Variable O&M	(\$5)	(\$0.55)			
Emissions	(\$147)	(\$17.05)			
Decommissioning	\$46	\$5.30			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$735)	(\$85.00)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$302	\$34.87			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$123	\$14.23			
Variable O&M	\$16	\$1.90			
Emissions	\$110	\$12.67			
Demand-Side Management	\$35	\$4.08			
Long-Term Contracts	(\$2)	(\$0.26)			
Market Purchases	\$92	\$10.64			
Market Sales	(\$4)	(\$0.46)			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$42	\$4.80			
Transmission Upgrades	(\$31)	(\$3.54)			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$683	\$78.93			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$53)	(\$6.07)			

50

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Jim Bridger 2 Case (C-18) (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$265)	(\$28.43)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$379)	(\$40.57)			
Variable O&M	(\$5)	(\$0.56)			
Emissions	(\$299)	(\$32.06)			
Decommissioning	\$46	\$4.91			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$903)	(\$96.71)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$370	\$39.67			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$123	\$13.18			
Variable O&M	\$15	\$1.57			
Emissions	\$211	\$22.64			
Demand-Side Management	\$35	\$3.78			
Long-Term Contracts	(\$2)	(\$0.21)			
Market Purchases	\$112	\$12.01			
Market Sales	\$31	\$3.35			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$44	\$4.73			
Transmission Upgrades	(\$31)	(\$3.28)			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$910	\$97.45			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	\$7	\$0.74			

51

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Jim Bridger 2 Case (C-18) (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$225)	(\$29.89)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$379)	(\$50.21)			
Variable O&M	(\$4)	(\$0.56)			
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00			
Decommissioning	\$46	\$6.06			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$563)	(\$74.60)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$224	\$29.75			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$123	\$16.32			
Variable O&M	\$14	\$1.91			
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00			
Demand-Side Management	\$35	\$4.66			
Long-Term Contracts	(\$2)	(\$0.33)			
Market Purchases	\$57	\$7.56			
Market Sales	(\$5)	(\$0.60)			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$40	\$5.28			
Transmission Upgrades	(\$31)	(\$4.06)			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$456	\$60.50			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$106)	(\$14.09)			

52

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.



Alternate-Year Summary Results





PaR Alternate-Year Results (Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR (\$m)	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement
C-01 (Benchmark)	\$23,310	n/a	n/a
C-21 (Naughton 1 (2022))	\$23,187	(\$123)	(\$190/kW-yr)
C-25 (Naughton 1 (2025))	\$23,275	(\$35)	(\$55/kW-yr)
C-26 (Naughton 1 (2028))	\$23,290	(\$20)	(\$31/kW-yr)
C-22 (Naughton 2 (2022))	\$23,212	(\$98)	(\$118/kW-yr)
C-27 (Naughton 2 (2025))	\$23,277	(\$33)	(\$39/kW-yr)
C-28 (Naughton 2 (2028))	\$23,298	(\$12)	(\$14/kW-yr)
C-17 (Jim Bridger 1 (2022))	\$23,197	(\$113)	(\$46/kW-yr)
C-29 (Jim Bridger 1 (2025))	\$23,270	(\$40)	(\$16/kW-yr)
C-30 (Jim Bridger 1 (2028))	\$23,262	(\$48)	(\$20/kW-yr)
C-31 (Jim Bridger 1 (2031))	\$23,238	(\$72)	(\$29/kW-yr)
C-10 (Hayden 1 (2022))	\$23,252	(\$58)	(\$290/kW-yr)
C-32 (Hayden 1 (2025))	\$23,271	(\$39)	(\$193/kW-yr)
C-33 (Hayden 1 (2028))	\$23,277	(\$33)	(\$166/kW-yr)

54

PaR Alternate-Year Results (High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR (\$m)	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement
C-01 (Benchmark)	\$28,176	n/a	n/a
C-21 (Naughton 1 (2022))	\$28,110	(\$66)	(\$103/kW-yr)
C-25 (Naughton 1 (2025))	\$28,190	\$13	\$21/kW-yr
C-26 (Naughton 1 (2028))	\$28,204	\$28	\$43/kW-yr
C-22 (Naughton 2 (2022))	\$28,134	(\$42)	(\$51/kW-yr)
C-27 (Naughton 2 (2025))	\$28,189	\$12	\$15/kW-yr
C-28 (Naughton 2 (2028))	\$28,212	\$35	\$43/kW-yr
C-17 (Jim Bridger 1 (2022))	\$28,107	(\$69)	(\$28/kW-yr)
C-29 (Jim Bridger 1 (2025))	\$28,161	(\$16)	(\$6/kW-yr)
C-30 (Jim Bridger 1 (2028))	\$28,157	(\$20)	(\$8/kW-yr)
C-31 (Jim Bridger 1 (2031))	\$28,142	(\$34)	(\$14/kW-yr)
C-10 (Hayden 1 (2022))	\$28,167	(\$9)	(\$47/kW-yr)
C-32 (Hayden 1 (2025))	\$28,159	(\$17)	(\$84/kW-yr)
C-33 (Hayden 1 (2028))	\$28,165	(\$11)	(\$56/kW-yr)

55

Conclusions from Alternate-Year Summary Results



- Results from the Low/None price-policy scenario were not finalized before this meeting.
- Nonetheless, assessment of later retirement dates across the units studied in the alternate-year cases for the base/base and high/high price-policy scenarios show that potential benefits for early retirement are greatest with assumed retirement at the end of 2022.
- Based on results of the alternate-year cases, stacked-retirement cases assume early retirement of units at the end of 2022.



Stacked-Retirement Summary Results





Stacked-Retirement Cases



- C-34 (Stacked 1: 357 MW)
 - Naughton 1-2 (2022)
- C-35 (Stacked 2: 711 MW)
 - Naughton 1-2 (2022)
 - Jim Bridger 1 (2022)
- C-36 (Stacked 3: 510 MW)
 - Naughton 1 (2022)
 - Jim Bridger 1 (2022)
- C-37 (Stacked 4: 554 MW)
 - Naughton 1 (2022)
 - Jim Bridger 1 (2022)
 - Hayden 1 (2022)
- C-38 (Stacked 5: 755 MW)
 - Naughton 1-2 (2022)
 - Hayden 1 (2022)

58

• Jim Bridger 1 (2022)

- C-39 (Stacked 6: 834 MW)
 - Naughton 1-2 (2022)
 - Hayden 1 (2022)
 - Jim Bridger 1 (2022)
 - Craig 2 (2022)
- C-40 (Stacked 7: 1,193 MW)
 - Naughton 1-2 (2022)
 - Hayden 1 (2022)
 - Jim Bridger 1-2 (2022)
 - Craig 2 (2022)
- C-41 (Stacked 8: 1,529 MW)
 - Naughton 1-2 (2022)
 - Jim Bridger 1-2 (2022)
 - Hayden 1-2 (2022)
 - Craig 1-2 (2022)
 - Dave Johnston 3 (2022)

PaR Stacked-Retirement Results (Base/Base Scenario)



Base/Base	PVRR (\$m)	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of Retirement (\$m)
C-01 (Benchmark)	\$23,310	n/a
C-34 (Stacked 1)	\$23,180	(\$130)
C-35 (Stacked 2)	\$23,009	(\$301)
C-36 (Stacked 3)	\$23,286	(\$24)
C-37 (Stacked 4)	\$23,288	(\$22)
C-38 (Stacked 5)	\$23,002	(\$307)
C-39 (Stacked 6)	\$22,993	(\$317)
C-40 (Stacked 7)	\$23,483	\$173
C-41 (Stacked 8)	\$23,600	\$290

- Before assessing hourly reliability, Cases C-35, C-38, and C-39 show the largest potential benefits—the PVRR(d) results for these three cases are very close.
- Cases C-40 and C-41, both in excess of 1,000 MW of incremental early retirements relative to the benchmark case, show a net cost before evaluating hourly reliability.

PaR Stacked-Retirement Results (High/High Scenario)



Base/Base	PVRR (\$m)	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of Retirement (\$m)
C-01 (Benchmark)	\$28,176	n/a
C-34 (Stacked 1)	\$28,109	(\$67)
C-35 (Stacked 2)	\$27,897	(\$279)
C-36 (Stacked 3)	\$28,252	\$76
C-37 (Stacked 4)	\$28,249	\$72
C-38 (Stacked 5)	\$27,896	(\$280)
C-39 (Stacked 6)	\$27,877	(\$299)
C-40 (Stacked 7)	\$28,397	\$221
C-41 (Stacked 8)	\$28,249	\$368

- As in the base/base price-policy scenario, before assessing hourly reliability, Cases C-35, C-38, and C-39 show the largest potential benefits—the PVRR(d) results for these three cases are very close.
- Cases C-40 and C-41, both in excess of 1,000 MW of incremental early retirements relative to the benchmark case, continue to show a net cost before evaluating hourly reliability.

PaR Stacked-Retirement Results (Low/None Scenario)



Base/Base	PVRR (\$m)	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of Retirement (\$m)
C-01 (Benchmark)	\$19,644	n/a
C-34 (Stacked 1)	\$19,487	(\$156)
C-35 (Stacked 2)	\$19,386	(\$257)
C-36 (Stacked 3)	\$19,549	(\$95)
C-37 (Stacked 4)	\$19,573	(\$71)
C-38 (Stacked 5)	\$19,359	(\$285)
C-39 (Stacked 6)	\$19,336	(\$308)
C-40 (Stacked 7)	\$19,747	\$103
C-41 (Stacked 8)	\$19,828	\$184

- As in the base/base and high/high price-policy scenarios, before assessing hourly reliability, Cases C-35, C-38, and C-39 show the largest potential benefits—the PVRR(d) results for these three cases are reasonably close.
- Cases C-40 and C-41, both in excess of 1,000 MW of incremental early retirements relative to the benchmark case, continues to show a net cost before evaluating hourly reliability.

^{61 *}Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Conclusions from Stacked-Retirement Summary Results

- Cases C-35, C-38, and C-39 consistently show the largest potential benefit of early retirement.
- Detailed results for these three cases, and Cases C-40 and C-41 are summarized in the next section.



Stacked-Retirement Detailed Results





Stacked Case C-35 Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Accelerated from 2035 to 2033	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	(\$11.0)
Accelerated from 2037 to 2033	SW WY	SW WY	SW WY	0	500	(\$3.3)
Accelerated from 2038 to 2037	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	0	615	(\$0.9)
					Total	(\$15.2)

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

64

Stacked Case C-35 (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)		
Cost Savings from Retired Unit				
Fuel	(\$106)	(\$29.12)		
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$569)	(\$155.87)		
Variable O&M	(\$0)	(\$0.03)		
Emissions	(\$35)	(\$9.56)		
Decommissioning	\$13	\$3.53		
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$697)	(\$191.05)		
Net Replacement Costs				
Fuel	\$149	\$40.95		
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$331	\$90.72		
Variable O&M	\$9	\$2.50		
Emissions	\$20	\$5.37		
Demand-Side Management	\$34	\$9.31		
Long-Term Contracts	\$6	\$1.68		
Market Purchases	(\$14)	(\$3.90)		
Market Sales	(\$104)	(\$28.52)		
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	(\$47)	(\$12.99)		
Transmission Upgrades	\$12	\$3.32		
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00		
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$396	\$108.44		
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$301)	(\$82.61)		

65

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-35 (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$145)	(\$28.15)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$569)	(\$110.09)
Variable O&M	(\$0)	(\$0.02)
Emissions	(\$87)	(\$16.77)
Decommissioning	\$13	\$2.49
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$788)	(\$152.54)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$215	\$41.60
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$331	\$64.08
Variable O&M	\$9	\$1.66
Emissions	\$19	\$3.65
Demand-Side Management	\$34	\$6.54
Long-Term Contracts	\$6	\$1.25
Market Purchases	\$4	\$0.72
Market Sales	(\$74)	(\$14.28)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	(\$47)	(\$9.01)
Transmission Upgrades	\$12	\$2.34
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$509	\$98.54
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$279)	(\$54.00)

66

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-35 (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)		
Cost Savings from Retired Unit				
Fuel	(\$68)	(\$30.66)		
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$569)	(\$256.43)		
Variable O&M	(\$0)	(\$0.07)		
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00		
Decommissioning	\$13	\$5.81		
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$624)	(\$281.34)		
Net Replacement Costs				
Fuel	\$97	\$43.54		
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$331	\$149.25		
Variable O&M	\$6	\$2.87		
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00		
Demand-Side Management	\$34	\$15.31		
Long-Term Contracts	\$6	\$2.73		
Market Purchases	(\$8)	(\$3.64)		
Market Sales	(\$65)	(\$29.19)		
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	(\$47)	(\$20.99)		
Transmission Upgrades	\$12	\$5.46		
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00		
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$367	\$165.34		
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$257)	(\$116.00)		

67

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.
Stacked Case C-38 Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Accelerated from 2035 to 2034	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	(\$5.6)
Accelerated from 2037 to 2033	SW WY	SW WY	SW WY	0	500	(\$3.3)
Accelerated from 2038 to 2037	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	0	615	(\$0.9)
					Total	(\$9.8)

68

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-38 (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$126)	(\$29.28)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$599)	(\$139.44)			
Variable O&M	(\$0)	(\$0.03)			
Emissions	(\$43)	(\$10.11)			
Decommissioning	\$13	\$3.01			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$756)	(\$175.86)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$148	\$34.33			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$320	\$74.41			
Variable O&M	\$10	\$2.38			
Emissions	\$16	\$3.75			
Demand-Side Management	\$26	\$6.09			
Long-Term Contracts	\$5	\$1.12			
Market Purchases	(\$11)	(\$2.46)			
Market Sales	(\$25)	(\$5.83)			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	(\$48)	(\$11.22)			
Transmission Upgrades	\$8	\$1.75			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$448	\$104.31			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$307)	(\$71.54)			

69

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-38 (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$165)	(\$28.39)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$599)	(\$103.23)
Variable O&M	(\$0)	(\$0.02)
Emissions	(\$99)	(\$16.98)
Decommissioning	\$13	\$2.23
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$850)	(\$146.39)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$222	\$38.22
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$320	\$55.09
Variable O&M	\$10	\$1.69
Emissions	\$15	\$2.60
Demand-Side Management	\$26	\$4.48
Long-Term Contracts	\$5	\$0.88
Market Purchases	\$12	\$2.12
Market Sales	(\$0)	(\$0.07)
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	(\$47)	(\$8.15)
Transmission Upgrades	\$8	\$1.30
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$570	\$98.15
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$280)	(\$48.25)

70

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-38 (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$85)	(\$30.45)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$599)	(\$213.98)			
Variable O&M	(\$0)	(\$0.06)			
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00			
Decommissioning	\$13	\$4.62			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$672)	(\$239.87)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$92	\$32.95			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$320	\$114.18			
Variable O&M	\$7	\$2.60			
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00			
Demand-Side Management	\$26	\$9.33			
Long-Term Contracts	\$5	\$1.69			
Market Purchases	(\$7)	(\$2.46)			
Market Sales	(\$16)	(\$5.82)			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	(\$47)	(\$16.92)			
Transmission Upgrades	\$8	\$2.69			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$387	\$138.24			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$285)	(\$101.63)			

71

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-39 Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Accelerated from 2035 to 2034	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	(\$5.6)
Accelerated from 2037 to 2033	SW WY	SW WY	SW WY	0	500	(\$3.3)
Accelerated from 2038 to 2037	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	0	615	(\$0.9)
					Total	(\$9.8)

72

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-39 (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$203)	(\$27.65)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$683)	(\$92.76)			
Variable O&M	(\$0)	(\$0.02)			
Emissions	(\$85)	(\$11.50)			
Decommissioning	\$13	\$1.80			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$957)	(\$130.12)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$155	\$21.02			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$315	\$42.82			
Variable O&M	\$10	\$1.32			
Emissions	\$16	\$2.18			
Demand-Side Management	\$40	\$5.42			
Long-Term Contracts	\$2	\$0.26			
Market Purchases	(\$5)	(\$0.69)			
Market Sales	\$136	\$18.49			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	(\$36)	(\$4.86)			
Transmission Upgrades	\$8	\$1.02			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$640	\$86.99			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$317)	(\$43.13)			

73

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-39 (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)
Cost Savings from Retired Unit		
Fuel	(\$233)	(\$27.39)
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$683)	(\$80.09)
Variable O&M	(\$0)	(\$0.01)
Emissions	(\$169)	(\$19.87)
Decommissioning	\$13	\$1.56
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$1,072)	(\$125.81)
Net Replacement Costs		
Fuel	\$239	\$28.07
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$315	\$36.98
Variable O&M	\$10	\$1.13
Emissions	\$21	\$2.49
Demand-Side Management	\$40	\$4.66
Long-Term Contracts	\$2	\$0.26
Market Purchases	\$15	\$1.73
Market Sales	\$158	\$18.59
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	(\$35)	(\$4.13)
Transmission Upgrades	\$8	\$0.88
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$773	\$90.68
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$299)	(\$35.14)

74

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-39 (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$166)	(\$27.84)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$683)	(\$114.54)			
Variable O&M	(\$0)	(\$0.03)			
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00			
Decommissioning	\$13	\$2.23			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$835)	(\$140.18)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$95	\$15.96			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$315	\$52.88			
Variable O&M	\$7	\$1.11			
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00			
Demand-Side Management	\$40	\$6.69			
Long-Term Contracts	\$2	\$0.31			
Market Purchases	(\$4)	(\$0.74)			
Market Sales	\$101	\$16.94			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	(\$35)	(\$5.85)			
Transmission Upgrades	\$8	\$1.26			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$528	\$88.56			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	(\$308)	(\$51.62)			

75

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-40 Overview





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Delayed from 2032 to 2033	Aeolus	Aeolus	UT South	1,500	1,850	\$52.9
Accelerated from 2035 to 2033	Yakima WA	Wakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	(\$11.0)
Accelerated from 2037 to 2033	SW WY	SW WY	SW WY	0	500	(\$3.3)
Accelerated from 2038 to 2037	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	0	615	(\$0.9)
Added in 2038	Bridger	Bridger	Populus	650	650	\$1,519.5
					Total	\$1,557.1

76

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-40 (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$666)	(\$28.53)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$1,058)	(\$45.29)			
Variable O&M	(\$8)	(\$0.34)			
Emissions	(\$346)	(\$14.81)			
Decommissioning	\$19	\$0.80			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$2,060)	(\$88.18)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$479	\$20.52			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$599	\$25.66			
Variable O&M	\$31	\$1.35			
Emissions	\$115	\$4.93			
Demand-Side Management	\$98	\$4.19			
Long-Term Contracts	(\$8)	(\$0.33)			
Market Purchases	\$262	\$11.21			
Market Sales	\$329	\$14.09			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$350	\$14.99			
Transmission Upgrades	(\$24)	(\$1.01)			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$2,233	\$95.60			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	\$173	\$7.41			

77

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-40 (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$733)	(\$27.61)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$1,058)	(\$39.85)			
Variable O&M	(\$9)	(\$0.33)			
Emissions	(\$697)	(\$26.27)			
Decommissioning	\$19	\$0.70			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$2,479)	(\$93.36)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$676	\$25.45			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$599	\$22.58			
Variable O&M	\$30	\$1.12			
Emissions	\$248	\$9.34			
Demand-Side Management	\$98	\$3.69			
Long-Term Contracts	(\$8)	(\$0.30)			
Market Purchases	\$327	\$12.31			
Market Sales	\$401	\$15.09			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$353	\$13.30			
Transmission Upgrades	(\$24)	(\$0.89)			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$2,699	\$101.68			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	\$221	\$8.32			

78

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-40 (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$587)	(\$29.30)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$1,058)	(\$52.79)			
Variable O&M	(\$7)	(\$0.36)			
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00			
Decommissioning	\$19	\$0.93			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$1,634)	(\$81.51)			
Net Replacement Costs					
Fuel	\$323	\$16.13			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$599	\$29.90			
Variable O&M	\$25	\$1.27			
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00			
Demand-Side Management	\$98	\$4.87			
Long-Term Contracts	(\$9)	(\$0.43)			
Market Purchases	\$159	\$7.93			
Market Sales	\$216	\$10.76			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$349	\$17.42			
Transmission Upgrades	(\$24)	(\$1.18)			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$1,737	\$86.67			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	\$103	\$5.16			

79

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-41 **Overview**





Change in Transmission Upgrades

Change in Year	Resource Location	From	То	ATC	Max Interconnection	Change in Nominal Capital (\$m)
Accelerated from 2024 to 2023	UT South	UT South	UT South	0	300	(\$0.2)
Accelerated from 2037 to 2028	SW WY	SW WY	SW WY	0	500	(\$7.1)
Delayed from 2032 to 2033	Aeolus	Aeolus	UT South	1,500	1,850	\$52.9
Accelerated from 2037 to 2033	UT North	UT North	UT North	0	500	(\$4.4)
Accelerated from 2035 to 2034	Yakima WA	Yakima WA	Southern OR	450	835	(\$5.6)
Added in 2037	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	Southern OR	1,500	1,115	\$548.7
Added in 2038	Bridger	Bridger	Populous	650	650	\$1,519.5
Removed in 2038	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	Willamette V. OR	0	615	(\$41.2)
					Total	\$2,062.6

POWERING YOUR GREATNESS

80

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-41 (PaR Base/Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$782)	(\$25.99)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$1,180)	(\$39.23)			
Variable O&M	(\$8)	(\$0.27)			
Emissions	(\$394)	(\$13.10)			
Decommissioning	\$20	\$0.66			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$2,344)	(\$77.93)			
Net Replacement Costs	Net Replacement Costs				
Fuel	\$675	\$22.44			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$722	\$24.00			
Variable O&M	\$48	\$1.58			
Emissions	\$130	\$4.31			
Demand-Side Management	\$93	\$3.10			
Long-Term Contracts	(\$9)	(\$0.29)			
Market Purchases	\$240	\$7.99			
Market Sales	\$437	\$14.52			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$304	\$10.12			
Transmission Upgrades	(\$6)	(\$0.20)			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$2,634	\$87.57			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	\$290	\$9.64			

81

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-41 (PaR High/High Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)			
Cost Savings from Retired Unit					
Fuel	(\$848)	(\$25.52)			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$1,180)	(\$35.51)			
Variable O&M	(\$9)	(\$0.27)			
Emissions	(\$798)	(\$24.02)			
Decommissioning	\$20	\$0.60			
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$2,815)	(\$84.72)			
Net Replacement Costs	Net Replacement Costs				
Fuel	\$921	\$27.72			
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$722	\$21.72			
Variable O&M	\$44	\$1.33			
Emissions	\$276	\$8.30			
Demand-Side Management	\$93	\$2.81			
Long-Term Contracts	(\$9)	(\$0.26)			
Market Purchases	\$317	\$9.54			
Market Sales	\$518	\$15.58			
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$307	\$9.23			
Transmission Upgrades	(\$6)	(\$0.18)			
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00			
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$3,183	\$95.79			
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	\$368	\$11.07			

82

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Stacked Case C-41 (PaR Low/None Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement (\$m)	Nom. Lev. (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 Retirement per MWh of Retired Generation (\$/MWh)		
Cost Savings from Retired Unit				
Fuel	(\$696)	(\$26.26)		
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	(\$1,180)	(\$44.49)		
Variable O&M	(\$7)	(\$0.27)		
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00		
Decommissioning	\$20	\$0.75		
Total Net Cost Savings from Retired Unit	(\$1,864)	(\$70.26)		
Net Replacement Costs				
Fuel	\$473	\$17.82		
Inc. Capital Rev. Req. and Fixed O&M	\$722	\$27.22		
Variable O&M	\$38	\$1.44		
Emissions	\$0	\$0.00		
Demand-Side Management	\$93	\$3.53		
Long-Term Contracts	(\$10)	(\$0.37)		
Market Purchases	\$147	\$5.55		
Market Sales	\$286	\$10.80		
Reserve/Energy Deficiencies	\$304	\$11.46		
Transmission Upgrades	(\$6)	(\$0.23)		
Transmission Reinforcements	\$0	\$0.00		
Total Net Replacement Cost	\$2,048	\$77.21		
Net (Benefit)/Cost of Assumed Early Retirement	\$184	\$6.95		

83

*Note: results presented here do not yet reflect potential incremental system-reliability costs, and do not include an intra-hour flexible resource credit applicable to flexible resources in each portfolio.

Conclusions from Stacked-Retirement Detailed Results

- Detailed results from Cases C-40 and C-41 show that energy/reserve deficiencies are a significant driver to the change in potential economic benefits associated with early retirement.
- PacifiCorp was unable to process hourly reliability studies for all cases, but did compile results for Cases C-01, C-35, and C-40—these results are summarized in the next section.



Reliability Assessment





Deterministic PaR Runs



- PacifiCorp performed an initial reliability assessment using an hourly deterministic PaR run for 2023—the first full year after assumed coal unit retirements in the stacked-retirement cases.
- Without stochastic shocks, thermal units are modeled using de-rated capacity to account for unplanned outages.
- System balances are summarized and graphed for load , net load (load net of Class 2 DSM, wind, and solar), spinning reserves, non-spinning reserves, and regulation reserves.
- Graphs show the type of resources that are providing system services across each hour of a selected day (i.e., peak load, peak netload ramp, etc.).
- PacifiCorp has not yet fully assessed the potential need for incremental frequency response.

Benchmark (Case C-01) Peak Load Day





- The peak load day occurs on July 17, 2023.
- Peak load = 10,581 MW in hour-ending 16.
- Maximum three-hour net-load ramp = 1,226 MW between hourending 11 and hour-ending 14.
- No unserved energy is observed.

Benchmark (Case C-01) Peak Net-Load Ramp Day





- The peak three-hour net-load ramp occurs on March 18, 2023.
- Maximum load = 7,162 MW in hour-ending 19.
- Peak three-hour net-load ramp = 3,218 MW between hour-ending 16 and hour-ending 19.
- No unserved energy is observed.

Benchmark (Case C-01) Capacity Shortfalls





- 29 hours (0.3%) show a capacity shortfall in non-spin and/or regulation reserves (mostly regulation reserves) between the end of March 2023 and April 2023.
- The maximum capacity shortfall is 290 MW, which occurs in hourending nine on March 28, 2023.
- There are no energy or spinning reserve shortfalls.

Benchmark (Case C-01) Peak Shortfall Day (Reserves)









- Max aggregate shortfall = 290 MW.
- No spinning reserve shortfalls.
- No non-spinning reserve shortfalls.
- One hour of regulation shortfall totaling 290 MW in hourending nine.

Stacked Case C-35 Peak Load Day





- The peak load day occurs on July 17, 2023.
- Peak load = 10,581 MW in hour-ending 16.
- Maximum three-hour net-load ramp = 1,225 MW between hourending 11 and hour-ending 14.
- No unserved energy is observed.

Stacked Case C-35 Peak Net-Load Ramp Day





- The peak three-hour net-load ramp occurs on March 18, 2023.
- Maximum load = 7,162 MW in hour-ending 19.
- Peak three-hour net-load ramp = 3,190 MW between hour-ending 16 and hour-ending 19.
- No unserved energy is observed.

Stacked Case C-35 Capacity Shortfalls





- 146 hours (1.7%) show a capacity shortfall in non-spin and/or regulation reserves (mostly regulation reserves) from March 2023 through May 2023 and from July 2023 through September 2023.
- The maximum capacity shortfall is 318 MW, which occurs in hour-ending nine on March 28, 2023.
- There are no energy shortfalls and one hour of a spinning reserve shortfall on July 17, 2023 (the peak-load day). The maximum hourly total shortfall on July 17, 2023 is 286 MW (17 MW spinning reserves, 90 MW nonspinning reserves, and 178 MW of regulation reserves).

Stacked Case C-35 Peak Shortfall Day (Reserves)









- Max aggregate shortfall = 318 MW in hour-ending nine.
- No spinning reserve shortfalls.
- Four hours of non-spinning reserve shortfalls from hour-ending seven through 10.
- Eight hours of regulation shortfall from hour-ending seven through 11, hour-ending 14, and hour-ending 17.

Stacked Case C-40 Peak Load Day





- The peak load day occurs on July 17, 2023.
- Peak load = 10,581 MW in hour-ending 16.
- Maximum three-hour net-load ramp = 1,224 MW between hourending 11 and hour-ending 14.
- No unserved energy is observed.

Stacked Case C-40 Peak Net-Load Ramp Day





- The peak three-hour net-load ramp occurs on March 18, 2023.
- Maximum load = 7,162 MW in hour-ending 19.
- Peak three-hour net-load ramp = 3,218 MW between hour-ending 16 and hour-ending 19.
- No unserved energy is observed.

Stacked Case C-40 Capacity Shortfalls





- 609 hours (7.0%) show a capacity shortfall in spinning, non-spinning and/or regulation reserves (mostly regulation reserves) in all months.
- The maximum capacity shortfall is 351 MW, which occurs in hour-ending nine on March 28, 2023.
- There are no energy shortfalls and several hours of a spinning reserve shortfall. The maximum hourly total shortfall on July 17, 2023 is 143 MW (41 MW non-spinning reserves, and 102 MW of regulation reserves).

Stacked Case C-40 Peak Shortfall Day (Reserves)









- Max aggregate shortfall = 351 MW in hour-ending nine.
- No spinning reserve shortfalls.
- 14 hours of non-spinning reserve shortfalls from hour-ending six through 15 and hour-ending 18 through 21.
- 16 hours of regulation shortfall from hour-ending six through 21.

Conclusions from the Initial Reliability Assessment



- Retirement cases can degrade system reliability, and the potential cost to remedy these issues is not directly factored into the results (i.e., via a potential addition or change in the resource mix to alleviate capacity shortfalls).
- Additional analysis is needed to evaluate potential reliability challenges and to assess potential costs to remedy these challenges.
- PacifiCorp will test alternative resource adjustments to address reliability issues for priority cases and review potential frequency-response shortfalls for these specific scenarios.
- PacifiCorp will continue to assess system reliability within the portfolio-development phase of the 2019 IRP.



Intra-Hour Flexible Resource Credit





PVRR(d) Impact of Intra-Hour Flex Resource Credit (IHFRC) (PaR Base / Base Scenario)



Study	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 without IHFRC (\$m)	PVRR(d) (Benefit)/Cost of 2022 with IHFRC (\$m)	Delta of PVRR(d) with and without IHFRC (\$m)
C-05 (Craig 2)	(\$29)	(\$28)	\$1
C-10 (Hayden 1)	(\$58)	(\$58)	\$0
C-17 (Jim Bridger 1)	(\$113)	(\$111)	\$2
C-21 (Naughton 1)	(\$123)	(\$121)	\$2
C-22 (Naughton 2)	(\$98)	(\$95)	\$3
C-35 (N1, N2, JB1)	(\$301)	(\$298)	\$3
C-38 (N1, N2, JB1, H1)	(\$307)	(\$305)	\$2
C-39 (N1, N2, JB1, H1, C2)	(\$317)	(\$315)	\$2

- The IHFRC was applied as an out-of-model adjustment to the benchmark and priority cases.
- The adjustment applies to all flexible resources in each portfolio—not just coal units.
- These results show that the IHFRC does not materially change the PVRR(d) results.