## BEFORE THE

### PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION OF OREGON

)

)

)

)

In the Matter of PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION OF OREGON,

Voluntary Renewable Energy Tariffs for Non-Residential Customers.

UM 1690

REPLY COMMENTS OF NOBLE AMERICAS ENERGY SOLUTIONS LLC

## INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY

In accordance with the directives of the Staff of the Public Utility Commission of Oregon ("OPUC" or "Commission"), Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC ("Noble Solutions") hereby submits its reply comments. Noble Solutions' initial comments thoroughly addressed the reasons why the utilities should not be permitted to use the voluntary renewable energy tariff ("VRET") to gain a special advantage over direct access suppliers by providing generation alternatives that are not subject to the same restrictions applicable to direct access programs to protect non-participating customers. Those comments are applicable to PacifiCorp's suggestions to the contrary and need not be repeated here. Noble Solutions files this reply for the limited purpose of addressing the newly proposed VRET models set forth in Portland General Electric Company's ("PGE") comments.

PGE's comments begin to provide a description of its preferred VRET model. Yet PGE's first proposal – titled "Subscription Model and Utility Owned" – is difficult to comment upon due to varying descriptions of it in PGE's comments. The proposal is unclear on whether the VRET customer will be served by existing rate-based renewable resources or some newly procured portfolio of rate-based renewable resources. However, each of these scenarios raises significant red flags and requires extensive further review to prevent cost shifts to non-participating customers and harm to the competitive market through the use of special contracts.

PGE's second proposal – titled "Power Purchase Agreement ('PPA') Model and Third Party/Customer Owned" – appears conceptually similar to existing direct access models utilizing the ongoing valuation methodology. While the benefit of replicating this little-used direct access model into a VRET is not entirely clear, it is not objectionable from the stand-point of nonparticipating customers and competitive suppliers so long as no unfair advantage is created in the process of calculating the avoided cost comparison.

## **REPLY COMMENTS**

## A. PGE's Utility-Ownership Model

PGE's first proposal for utility-ownership is unclear. On the one hand, PGE describes its utility-ownership option as a green resource that "would be built" and for which "PGE would rate base the equivalent of null power at avoided cost." *PGE's Comments* at 1. This appears to describe a model where PGE procures a new portfolio of VRET-specific renewable generation. On the other hand, PGE explains: "Using *an existing resource* in a VRET would, by its very use, eliminate that project from use in compliance with the RPS and require utilities to acquire additional new resources to comply with the RPS." *PGE's Comments* at 3 (emphasis added). It is therefore unclear whether PGE's proposal is: (1) to acquire a new portfolio of renewable resources to solely serve VRET customers, (2) to use existing PGE renewable resources to serve VRET load and to "backfill" its renewable portfolio standard ("RPS") needs for non-VRET customers with new resources, or (3) to pick and choose on a case-by-case basis and thus use a

## UM 1690 NOBLE SOLUTIONS' REPLY COMMENTS PAGE 2

VRET "tariff" as a de facto special contract option. Each scenario carries a significant risk of violating HB 4126's directives.

### 1. New Rate-Based Resources Serving VRET Load

The proposal to rate-base newly acquired renewable resources for VRET customers raises significant problems. Rate-basing a new resource that is acquired outside of the least-cost planning process poses risks of under-subscription, departing customers who decide to leave the VRET or go out of business altogether, and complex accounting problems to ensure non-participating customers are held harmless. With regard to the obvious problem of a potential under-subscription, PGE states it "is not interested in taking on significant risk of under subscription." *PGE's Comments* at 8. This is hardly a solution that could be endorsed in the Commission's Study under HB 4126. PGE also provides the conclusory explanation that everything will work out just fine because the VRET customers will still be paying cost-of-service rates plus an unspecified "premium." But PGE fails to acknowledge that the "premium," enrollment windows, and other restrictions must mirror the parameters of existing direct access options to comply with HB 4126 and protect non-participating customers.

PGE also explains that it "does not view VRET customers as 'leaving its cost of service system." *PGE's Comments* at 7. This over-simplifies PGE's proposal. Instead of the least-cost portfolio developed through years of planning, PGE's proposal would result in a portfolio that would likely contain VRET resources that are not a part of the least-cost plan. The VRET customers will opt out of PGE's least-cost portfolio in a very similar manner to direct access customers. However, unlike direct access, these VRET alternative generation resources will be rate-based – creating a very real risk of cross subsidization and preferential treatment to VRET

customers to increase the utility's profit and/or create a competitive advantage over direct access suppliers. Precisely tracking and assigning the cost differential to VRET customers will present difficult accounting issues and could provide opportunities for cost-shifting and preferential treatment that the Commission should not allow.

### 2. Existing Resources Serving VRET Load

PGE's proposal to use existing utility-owned renewable resources to serve VRET load likewise presents unreasonable difficulties. For example, PGE's existing renewable resources did not all cost the same – thus providing PGE with the opportunity to assign the renewable energy credits ("RECs") from the cheapest existing resources to the VRET to keep VRET costs down to the disadvantage of non-VRET customers who will be left to back-fill with more expensive new renewable resources to meet the RPS needs. This risk is all the more pronounced with the recent and future expirations of various federal tax credits. Additionally, undersubscription or departing VRET customers could cause PGE to acquire additional renewable resources outside of the least-cost plan that are not needed for VRET and non-VRET loads. These and other problems must be resolved prior to any Study or Commission decision that would authorize a utility-ownership model.

#### **3.** De Facto Special Contract Tariff

Nothing in HB 4126 exempts the VRET from the requirement that this special rate classification not harm remaining customers. *See* ORS 757.230; *Wah Chang v. Pub. Util. Commn.*, 256 Or.App. 151, 165, 301 P.3d 934, 942 (2013) (""ORS 757.230(1)(a) and (b) protect remaining customers by ensuring that special tariff rates do not become too low."). Because the VRET will be a "rate classification primarily related to . . . a service alternative," ORS 757.230,

it "*must protect—not harm*—remaining customers." *Wah Chang*, 256 Or.App. at 166-67, 301 P.3d at 943 (emphasis added).

The Commission should ensure the ambiguity in existing utility-ownership proposals is not leveraged to turn the VRET into a de facto special contract option with the high likelihood of harming remaining customers. The unspecified "premium" charge, ambiguity as to whether existing or new resources will be used, and multiple other ambiguities in PGE's proposal create loopholes that would result in a de facto special contract option that could change with each individual customer. Instead of endorsing this approach, the HB 4126 Study should conclude that a utility-ownership option should not be pursued because HB 4126 was not intended to be an end-run around the Commission's prohibition against special contracts to the potential (and very likely) detriment of non-participating customers and the competitive market. At a bare minimum, utility-ownership models would require extensive further workshops and, even if the issues could be resolved, would create a major administrative burden on the Commission after their adoption.

#### B. PPA Model and Third-Party/Customer Owned

PGE's non-utility-owned model does not rely on an ambiguous "premium" charge and instead requires the VRET customer to pay cost-of-service rates against which are credited the avoided cost of the new renewable energy supplied to PGE. This is conceptually similar to existing one-year and three-year direct access options under the ongoing valuation methodology where the customer perpetually pays cost-of-service rates with a credit or charge for the market value of the generation the utility would have supplied to the customer. *See* OAR 860-038-0005(41); PacifiCorp's Schedule 294; PGE's Schedule 128. PGE does not explain why an

### UM 1690 NOBLE SOLUTIONS' REPLY COMMENTS PAGE 5

ambiguous "premium" applies to its utility-owned model while its non-utility-owned model essentially tracks existing short-term direct access options. In any event, Noble Solutions does not find anything objectionable regarding PGE's non-utility-owned model so long as the avoided cost valuation does not create an unfair advantage over direct access options.

DATED this 9th day of January, 2015.

# RICHARDSON ADAMS, PLLC

/s/ Gregory M. Adams

Gregory M. Adams (OSB No. 101779) 515 N. 27<sup>th</sup> Street Boise, Idaho 83702 Telephone: (208) 938-2236 Fax: (208) 938-7904 greg@richardsonadams.com

Of Attorneys for the Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC

UM 1690 NOBLE SOLUTIONS' REPLY COMMENTS PAGE 6

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on the 9<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2015, a true and correct copy of the within and foregoing **REPLY COMMENTS OF NOBLE AMERICAS ENERGY SOLUTIONS LLC, IN DOCKET UM 1690** was served as follows:

Michael T Weirich PUC STAFF - DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE 1162 Court Street, NE Salem OR 97301-4096 michael.weirich@doj.state.or.us

Ruchi Sadhir OREGON PUBLIC UTILITIES COMM. PO Box 1088 Salem OR 97308-2148 ruchi.sadhir@state.or.us

PORTLAND GENERAL ELECTRIC Karla Wenzel 121 SW Salmon St – 1WTC0702 Portland OR 97204 pge.opuc.filines@pgn.com

PORTLAND GENERAL ELECTRIC J Richard George Elizabeth Paul 121 SW Salmon 1WTC13 Portland OR 97204 richard.george@pgn.com elizabeth.paul@pgn.com

Kacia Brockman Julie Peacock OREGON DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY 625 Marion St NE Salem OR 97301-3737 <u>kacia.brockman@state.or.us</u> julie.peacock@state.or.us

Doris Penwell AOC/CREA dpenwell@aolweb.org Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid

\_\_\_\_ Facsimile

X Electronic Mail

\_\_\_\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid

\_\_\_ Facsimile

X Electronic Mail

\_\_\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid

Facsimile

X\_ Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Suzanne Leta Liou ATKINS 12725 SW Millikan Way Ste 230 Portland OR 97005 suzanne.liou@atkinsglobal.com

Angus Duncan BONNEVILLE ENVIRONMENTAL FOUNDATION 240 SW First Ave Portland OR 97204 aduncan@b-e-f.org

G Catriona McCracken Jeff Bissonnette CITIZENS' UTILITY BOARD OF OREGON 610 SW Broadway Ste 400 Portland OR 97205 <u>catriona@oregoncub.org</u> jeff@oregoncub.org dockets@oregoncub.org

Andria Jacob Benjamin Walters CITY OF PORTLAND City Attorneys Office 1221 SW 4<sup>th</sup> Ave Rm 430 Portland OR 97204 andria.jabov@portlandoregon.gov ben.walters@portlandoregon.gov

Michael Armstrong David Tooze CITY OF PORTLAND Planning & Sustainability 1900 SW 4<sup>th</sup> Ave Ste 7100 Portland OR 97201 <u>michael.armstrong@portlandoregon.gov</u> <u>david.tooze@portlandoregon.gov</u>

Jude Noland CLEARING UP 734 Hill Rd Walla Walla WA 93362 nolandj@charter.net Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

- Hand Delivery
  U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
  Facsimile
  X Electronic Mail
- Hand Delivery
  U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
  Facsimile
  X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Brian Skeahan CREA brian.skeahan@yahoo.com

Joshua D Weber Melinda J Davison DAVISON VAN CLEAVE 333 SW Taylor Ste 400 Portland OR 97204 <u>jdw@dvclaw.com</u> <u>mjd@dvclaw.com</u>

Kevin Higgins ENERGY STRATEGIES LLC 215 State St Ste 200 Salt Lake City UT 84111-2322 khiggins@energystrat.com

Kourtney Nelson Sara Parsons Kevin Lynch IBERDROLA RENEWABLES INC 1125 NW Couch St Ste 700 Portland OR 97209 kourtney.nelson@iberdrolaren.com sara.parsons@iberdrolaren.com kevin.lynch@iberdrolaren.com

Banjo Reed IBEW L.U. 659 4480 Rogue Valley Hwy #3 Central point OR 97520 banjo@ibew659.org

Michael Youngblood Connie Aschenbrenner Tami White IDAHO POWER COMPANY PO Box 70 Boise ID 83707 myoungblood@idahopower.com caschenbrenner@idahopower.com twhite@idahopower.com Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid Facsimile X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid Facsimile

X\_ Electronic Mail

Robert D Kahn NIPPC PO Box 504 Mercer Island WA 98040 rkahn@nippc.org

Wendy Gerlitz NW ENERGY COALITION 1205 SE Flavel Portland OR 97202 wendy@nwenergy.org

Erik Anderson PACIFIC POWER 825 NE Multnomah St Ste 1800 Portland OR 97232 erik.anderson@pacificorp.com

Joelle Steward Alisa M Dunlap PACIFIC POWER & LIGHT/PACIFICORP 825 NE Multnomah Ste 2000 Portland OR 97232 joelle.steward@pacificorp.com alisa.dunlap@pacificorp.com

Megan Decker RENEWABLE NORTHWEST 421 SW 6<sup>th</sup> Ave Ste 1125 Portland OR 97204-1629 <u>megan@renewablenw.org</u> dockets@renewablenw.org

Steve W Chriss Ken Baker WAL-MART STORES INC 2001 SE 10<sup>th</sup> St Bentonville AR 72716-0550 <u>stephen.chriss@wal-mart.com</u> ken.baker@wal-mart.com

Letha Tawney WORLD RESOURCES INSTITUTE <u>ltawney@wri.org</u> Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

\_\_\_

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Jacques Grant YAM SERVICES 1819 SW 5<sup>th</sup> Ave Ste 342 Portland OR 97201 electric@yamservices.com

Carl Fink 628 SW Chestnut St Ste200 Portland OR 97219 cmfink@blueplanetlaw.com

Jim Stanway jimstanway@fb.com

Kevin Devan ADOBE SYSTEMS <u>devan@adobe.com</u>

Dick Sheehy CH2M HILL dick.sheehy@ch2m.com

Sarah Garrison CITY OF HILLSBORO sarah.garrison@hillsboro-oregon.gov

Ann English Gravatt CLIMATE SOLUTIONS 917 SW Oak – Ste 303 Portland OR 97205 ann@cllimatesolutions.org

Mary Lynch CONSTELLATION ENERGY COMMODITIES GROUP INC 5074 Nawal Dr El Dorado Hills CA 95762 mary.lynch@constellation.com  Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid Facsimile

X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

\_\_\_\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid

\_\_\_ Facsimile

X\_ Electronic Mail

\_\_\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid

 $\frac{1}{X} Electronic Mail$ 

\_\_\_\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid

\_\_\_\_ Facsimile

X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X\_Electronic Mail

Thad Roth ENERGY TRUST OF OREGON 421 SW Oak Ste 300 Portland OR 97204 thad.roth@energytrust.org

Ann Blackwood FACEBOOK 561 Garden St Sacramento CA 95815 <u>annb@fb.com</u>

Kelsey Wilson GALLATIN PUBLIC AFFAIRS kelseyw@gallatinpa.com

Ann L Fisher LEGAL & CONSULTING SERVICES PO Box 25302 Portland OR 97298-0302 <u>ann@annfisherlaw.com</u>

Christine Lewis MULTNOMAH COUNTY DISTRICT 1 christine.lewis@multco.us

Imogen Taylor David Brown OBSIDIAN RENEWABLES 5 Centerpointe Dr Ste 590 Lake Oswego OR 97035 <u>itaylor@obsidianrenewables.com</u> <u>dbrown@obsidianrenewables.com</u>

Colonel Christian F Rees LTC Kenneth Safe OREGON NATIONAL GUARD <u>christian.f.rees.mil@mail.mil</u> <u>kenneth.safe.mil@mail.mil</u>

Evyan Jarvis OXLEY & ASSOCIATES evyanjarvis@oxleyandassociatesinc.com \_\_\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid

\_\_\_\_ Facsimile

X Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

- Hand Delivery
  U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
  Facsimile
- X Electronic Mail

\_\_\_\_ Hand Delivery

- \_\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid Facsimile
- X Electronic Mail
- Hand Delivery
  U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
  Facsimile
  X\_Electronic Mail
- Hand Delivery
  U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
  Facsimile
- X Electronic Mail
- Hand Delivery
  U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
  Facsimile
  X Electronic Mail

Matt Ruckwardt SCHNITZER STEEL INDUSTRIES INC 299 SW Clay St Ste 350 Portland OR 97201 <u>mruckwardt@schn.com</u>

Genevieve Dufau SOLARCITY gdufau@solarcity.com

Heidi Gen Kuong ATKINS GLOBAL 1410 Rocky Ridge Dr Roseville CA 95661 <u>heidi.genkuong@atkinsglobal.com</u>

Kimberly Krutski Machlus ATKINS GLOBAL 482 South Keller Rd Orlando FL 32810 <u>kimberly.krutski@atkinsglobal.com</u>

Justin Barnes Kimberly Kooles KEYS FOX & WIEDMAN LLP <u>jbarnes@kfwlaw.com</u> kkooles@kfwlaw.com

John Leslie SHELL ENERGY 600 West Broadway Ste 2600 San Diego CA 92101 jleslie@mckennalong.com

Robin Quarrier CENTER FOR RESOURCE SOLUTIONS 1012 Tourney Ave 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor San Francisco CA 94122 robin@resource-solutions.org

Paul Cosgrove LINDSAY HARD LLP 1300 SW 5<sup>th</sup> Ave Ste 3400 Portland OR 97201 pcosgrove@lindsayhart.com \_\_\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid \_\_\_ Facsimile

X\_ Electronic Mail

\_\_\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid

Facsimile

X\_ Electronic Mail

\_\_\_\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid

\_\_\_\_ Facsimile

X\_ Electronic Mail

\_\_\_\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid

\_\_\_\_ Facsimile

X Electronic Mail

 Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid Facsimile

X Electronic Mail

\_\_\_\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid

\_\_\_\_ Facsimile

<u>X</u> Electronic Mail

\_\_\_\_ Hand Delivery

\_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid Facsimile

X Electronic Mail

Fred Heutte NW ENERGY COALITION PO Box 40308 Portland OR 97240-0308 frred@nwenergy.org

Rhonda Rasmussen PacifiCorp 825 NE Multnomah Ste 300 Portland OR 97232 rhonda.rasmussen@pacificorp.com

Noel Mingo Portland State University noel.mingo@pdx.edu \_\_\_\_Hand Delivery \_\_\_U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid \_\_\_\_Facsimile \_\_\_\_\_Electronic Mail

Hand Delivery
 U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid
 Facsimile
 X Electronic Mail

Signed: Gregory M. Adams