

Qwest

421 Southwest Oak Street Suite 810 Portland, Oregon 97204 Telephone: 503-242-5420 Facsimile: 503-242-8589 e-mail: carla.butler@qwest.com

Carla M. Butler Lead Paralegal

November 17, 2006

Annette Taylor Oregon Public Utility Commission 550 Capitol St., NE Suite 215 Salem, OR 97301

Re: AR 506 / AR 510

Dear Ms. Taylor:

Enclosed for filing in the above entitled matter please find an original and (5) copies of Qwest Corporation's Final Comments, along with a certificate of service.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to give me a call.

Sincerely,

Carla M. Butler

CMB:

Enclosure

cc: Service List (via e-mail transmission)

#### BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION OF OREGON

### AR 506/AR 510

In the Matters of

Rulemaking to Amend and Adopt Permanent Rules in OAR 860, Divisions 024 and 028, Regarding Pole Attachment Use and Safety (AR 506)

Rulemaking to Amend Rules in OAR 860, Division 028 Relating to Sanctions for Attachments to Utility Poles and Facilities (AR 510) **QWEST'S FINAL COMMENTS** 

Qwest Corporation ("Qwest") submits its final comments regarding the Oregon Joint Use Association's ("OJUA") revised proposed rules for pole attachment sanctions in Division 28 of Chapter 860 of the Oregon Administrative Rules, as well as other Division 28 proposals.

### **COMMENTS**

## I. COMMENTS REGARDING SANCTIONS RULES

As Qwest mentioned in its September 28, 2006 initial comments, Qwest appreciates the OJUA's efforts in proposing revisions to the pole attachment sanctions rules in Division 28 of Chapter 860, including its more recent October 4, 2006 proposal and its most recent revisions on November 16, 2006. Qwest believes that most of the OJUA's proposals are a vast improvement of the current rules. However, Qwest continues to generally oppose the OJUA's proposal because the OJUA proposal still continues to maintain the current system under which the Commission's rules authorize interested private parties (pole owners) to impose and collect penalties on other private parties (pole occupants). As Qwest has stated, it believes that the imposition of penalties by pole owners, who necessarily have a self-interest in recovering sanctions, is unlawful. In addition, any rules that authorize such penalties exceed the

Commission's own statutory authority, as well as violate several constitutional principles. Further, any penalties that the Commission's rules allow must be recovered in *court*, and in the name of the State of Oregon. Further still, the only payments that may lawfully be collected by pole owners for violation of the Commission's rules or the terms of a pole attachment agreement are those that are compensatory in nature, and not based on pre-set penalties that have no relation to any harm that the pole owners have suffered or the cost that the pole occupant has caused.

Further, and without waiving its positions, Qwest believes that if the Commission continues to allow pole owners to impose penalties, it must, at a minimum, provide for additional procedural safeguards to protect the rights of parties from whom pole owners are seeking penalties. Thus, if the Commission continues to have rules that authorize pole owners to recover penalties, the Commission should provide that such pole owners must seek such penalties in court actions. At a very minimum, the Commission should take a more active role in the imposition of such penalties, and should provide parties with procedural protections that are not available under the current rules.

In essence, Qwest will not reiterate all of its comments from September 28, 2006.

Rather, Qwest simply mentions that it incorporates its September 28, 2006 comments fully here.

In addition, Qwest agrees with Charter's comments that argued for the rescission or elimination of the sanctions rules. Specifically, Qwest agrees with Charter that the sanction rules undermine the very purpose of Oregon pole attachment law and allow pole owners to recover supra-compensatory rates (especially because they have created inappropriate incentives that encourage abuses and undermine pole regulation and because the non-compensatory nature of the sanctions allows for over-recovery). The sanctions rules also undermine the promotion of communications deployment in violation of the express public policies of both Oregon and federal authorities.

Qwest further agrees with Embarq's (formerly United/Sprint) comments that argued for rescission or elimination of the sanctions rules because these rules continue to be unreasonable and overly punitive and because they encourage uneconomic bureaucracies that treat sanctions as a revenue stream (instead of purely as a deterrent to unsafe pole attachment practices). Qwest further agrees with Embarq that the magnitude of the sanctions in these rules creates an environment that is anticompetitive and a barrier to entry, especially because the rules encourage pole owners to exercise monopoly power over poles, and they take away from the reason (providing the best quality services to Oregonians) for the leasing of poles to begin with. In short, the sanctions rules go well beyond their original intent to encourage safe and responsible uses of poles to provide power and telecommunications services.

Further still, Qwest notes that although several commenting parties agree to support the OJUA's proposal as a compromise proposal (including Verizon, Electric Lightwave and the Oregon Cable Telecommunications Association ("OCTA")), none of these parties supported the status quo regarding sanctions, or supported sanctions in general. In fact, even Staff itself did not comment on the sanctions rules or OJUA's proposal.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> For example, "Electric Lightwave believes that monetary sanctions are not necessary and should be eliminated entirely" and that there is a "perverse incentive" for "pole owners to terminate joint use contracts that have been in place for years solely to maximize the amount of penalties they may recover." Qwest further agrees with Electric Lightwave about a "potential significant windfall that has been available to pole owners recently [that] has resulted in an increase in the number of joint use disputes and [that] has generally harmed the tradition of cooperative joint use in the state." Likewise, Verizon notes that "the sanctions rules have been used by some owners to try to force occupants into entering into unfair pole attachment agreements based on the occupants' fear that if no agreement is reached, they would face sanctions unilaterally imposed by the owners," and that "[t]he rules also appear to have encouraged owners to conduct duplications 'special' audits or inspections in the hopes of finding purported attachment violations that would allow the owners to impose sanctions." Finally, Qwest agrees with OCTA's comments about sanctions rules, including the cooperative 20-year history of no contested cases between pole owners and licensees before the Commission adopted its sanctions rules in 2000 and the number of disputes brought before the Commission in the past few years. Qwest further agrees with OCTA that the sanctions rules create incentives and opportunities for some pole owners to demand and exact unreasonable rents, terms, and conditions and that a pole owner has a strong incentive not to successfully conclude renewal negotiations before a contract expires so that the owner can levy the highest possible sanction against the attacher (under the rules for penalties for not having a contract).

Indeed, the *only parties* that filed comments in support of sanction rules were PacifiCorp in its October 4, 2006 comments a week after Qwest's comments and the joint comments of Central Lincoln PUD and Northern Wasco County PUD. However, while purporting to justify its position in favor of sanctions on various grounds (such as safety reasons and contractual breaches for non-compliance, and now, more recently, based on arguments about "financial incentives" to insure compliance), PacifiCorp itself does not address any of the legal, policy and operational concerns that Qwest raised the week before in its September 28, 2006 comments.<sup>2</sup>

Finally, Qwest notes that if the Commission determines to retain sanctions rules, but is willing to adopt the OJUA proposal, and without waiving Qwest's general objections to and suggestions about the penalty rules, Qwest continues to support the comments it made on September 28, 2006 on some of OJUA's specific rule proposals. Specifically, Qwest continues to supports the comments it made with respect to OAR 860-028-0130 (sanctions for having no contract), OAR 860-028-0140 (sanctions for having no permit), OAR 860-028-0150 (sanctions for violation of other duties), OAR 860-028-0180 (removal of occupant pole attachments) and OAR 860-028-0220 (resolution of factual disputes).

# II. COMMENTS REGARDING DIVISION 28 (NON-SANCTIONS) RULES

Finally, Qwest agrees with and joins in the OJUA's comments in response to the Commission Staff's new proposed language on vegetation management for telecommunications pole owners and occupants. First, Qwest specifically agrees with the OJUA that the language for vegetation management for telecommunications pole owners and occupants should be in the rules regarding duties for pole owners (OAR 860-028-0115) and duties for pole occupants (OAR 860-028-0120). Further, Qwest supports the OJUA's proposed rules because they establish

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> In addition, the PUDs seem to tie sanctions solely as a *quid pro quo* for rental rate reductions. The PUDs likewise do not address any of the legal, policy and operational arguments that Qwest raised in its initial comments.

occupant duties to correct violations or to create a plan of correction. Finally, Qwest agrees with

and supports the OJUA's proposal because it ties a mandatory duty of vegetation trimming of

pole occupants and owners to appropriate safety levels by requiring the immediate trimming of

vegetation that causes imminent danger, and by requiring the trimming of vegetation that causes

a significant safety risk no later than 180 days (or that vegetation trimming be included within a

plan of correction acceptable to both the pole owner and occupant within 60 days).

**CONCLUSION** 

Accordingly, Qwest respectfully submits that the Commission should rescind or

eliminate its pole attachment sanctions rules, or, at a very minimum, that it should substantially

revise them consistent with Qwest's comments. Qwest further submits that the Commission

should adopt the OJUA's Division 28 proposals regarding non-sanction rules, including the

OJUA's recent proposed rules for vegetation management.

Respectfully submitted,

DATED: November 17, 2006

Alex M. Duarte, OSB No. 02045

**Owest** 

421 SW Oak Street, Suite 810

Portland, OR 97204

503-242-5623

503-242-8589 (facsimile)

Alex.Duarte@qwest.com

Attorney for Qwest Corporation

5

# CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE VIA E-MAIL TRANSMISSION AR 506/AR 510

I hereby certify that on the 17<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2006, a true and correct copy of the foregoing QWEST CORPORATION'S FINAL COMMENTS, in the above entitled docket, was served upon the following persons via means of e-mail transmission to the e-mail addresses listed on the following pages.

Dated this 17<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2006.

**Qwest Corporation** 

by: \_

Alex M. Duarte (OSB No. 02045) 421 SW Oak Street, suite 810 Portland, OR 97204 503-242-5623 (Phone) 503-242-8589 (Facsimile) alex.duarte@qwest.com

Attorney for Qwest Corporation

Susan K. Ackerman Attorney P.O. Box 10207 Portland, OR 97296-0207 susan.k.ackerman@comcast.net

Matt Coons matt.coons@comspanusa.net

Jim Deason Attorney at Law 521 SW Clay Street, Ste 107 Portland,OR 97201-5407 <u>i</u> <u>imdeason@comcast.net</u>

Roger Kuhlman 633 7<sup>th</sup> Street NW Salem, OR 97304 kuhlman@salemelectric.com

Scott Johnson City of Ashland 90 North Mountain Ave Ashland, OR *97520* johnsons@ashland.or.us

Denise Estep Central Lincoln PUD P.O. Box 1126 Newport, OR 97365 dstep@cencoast.com

Michael L. Wilson Central Lincoln PUD 2129 N. Coast Hwy Newport, OR 97365-0090 mwilson@cencoast.com

Doug Cooley CenturyTel of Oregon Inc. 707 13<sup>th</sup> Street, Ste 280 Salem, OR 97301 doug.cooley@centurytel.com David Luchini CenturyTel of Oregon Inc. P.O. Box 327 Aurora, OR 97002 dave.luchini@centrytel.com

Gary Lee Charter communications Corp. 521 NE 136<sup>th</sup> Ave Vancouver, WA 98684 glee@chartercom.com

Keene C. Basso Line Superintendent Clatskanie PUD P.O. Box 216 kbasso@clatskaniepud.com

Bill Kiggins
Clear Creek Mutual Telephone Co.
18238 S. Fischers Mill Rd.
Oregon City, OR 970445-9696
bkiggins@clearcreek.coop

Stephen R.Cieslewicz CN Utility Consulting P.O. Box 746 Novato, CA 94948-0746 steve@cnutility.com

Scott Thompson Attorney Cole Raywid & Braverman LLP 1919 Pennsylvania Ave, NW Ste 200 Washington, DC 20006 sthompson@crblaw.com

Scott Wheeler
Comcast Phone of Oregon LLC
9605 SW Nimbus Ave
Portland, OR 97008
Scott\_wheeler2@comcastcabl.com

# Sebastian McCrohan Comspanusa sebastian.mccrohan@comspanusa.net

Stuart Sloan Consumer Power Inc. P.O. Box 1180 Philomath, OR 97370 stuarts@cpi.coop

Andrew McBride Coos Curry Electric Cooperative P.O. Box 1265 Port Orford, OR *97465* amcbride@cooscurryelectric.com

Linda L. Spurgeon Coos Curry Electric Cooperative P.O. Box 1265 Port Orford, OR 97465 spurgeon@cooscurryelectric.com

Sarah K. Wallace Attorney at Law Davis Wright Tremaine 1300 SW Fifth Avenue Suite 2300 Portland, OR 97201 sarahwallace@dwt.com

Michael T. Weirich Assistant Attorney General Department of Justice Regulated Utility & Business Section 1162 Court Street, NE Salem, OR 97301-4096 michael.weirich@doj.state.or.us

Phil Charlton Electric Lightwave pcharlton@eli-consulting.com

Charles L. Best
Attorney At Law
Electric Lightwave
P.O. Box 8905
Vancouver, WA 98668-8905
charles\_best@eli.net

Nancy Judy
State Executive
Embarq Communications Inc.
902 Wasco Street A0412 Hood
River, OR 97031
nancyjudv@embarq.com

Craig Andrus
Customer Engineering Supervisor
33733 Seavey Loop Rd.
Eugene, OR 97405-9614
craig.andrus@epud.org

Catherine A. Murray Manager-Regulatory Affairs Eschelon Telecom of Oregon Inc 730 Second Ave S, Ste 900 Minneapolis, MN 55402-2489 cammurray@eschelon.com

Mark Oberle Property Manager Eugene Water & Electric Board P.O. Box 10148 Eugene, OR 97440 mark.oberle@eweb.eugene.or.us

Christy Monson Harold Leahy & Kieran 223 A Street, Ste D Springfield, OR 97477-4500 c1cm haroldleahy.com

Richard W. Ryan President/CEO Hunter Communications Inc 801 Enterprise Dr, Ste 101 Central Point, OR 97502 rryan@coreds.net

Ronald W.Jones IBEW Local 659 4480 Rogue Hwy #3 Central Point, OR 97502-1695 ronjones@ibew659.org Barton L. Kline, Esq.
Lisa Nordstrom, Esq.
Idaho Power Company
P.O. Box 70
Boise, ID 83707
Inordstrom@idahopower.com
bkline@idahopower.com

Lisa F. Rackner Attorneys for Idaho Power Co. Ater Wynne LLP 222 SW Columbia, Suite 1800 Portland, OR 97201-6618 lfr@aterwynne.com

Brent Van Patten
Joint Use Engineer
Idaho Power Company
P.O. Box 70
Boise, ID 83707
bvanpatten@idahopower.com

Andrea Fogue Senior Staff Associate League of Oregon Cities P.O. Box 928 1201 Court Street, NE, Ste 200 Salem, OR 97308 afogue@orcities.org

Scott Rosenbalm McMinnville City of Water & Light P.O. Box 638 McMinnville, OR 97128-0638 sgr@mc-power.com

Eugene A. Fry Millennium Digital Media 3633 136<sup>th</sup> P1, SE # 107 Bellevue, WA 98006 gfry@mdm.net

Brooks Harlow
Miller Nash LLP
601 Union Street, Ste 4400

Dave Wildman
City of Monmouth
401 N. Hogan Rd.
Monmouth, OR 97361
dwildman@ci.monmouth.or.us

Michael Dewey
Executive Director
Oregon Cable and Telecommunications Assoc
1249 Commercial Street, SE
Salem, OR 97302
mdewey@oregoncable.com

The Honorable Robert Ackerman Oregon House of Representatives 900 Court Street, NE, Rm H-389 Salem, OR 97310

Genoa Ingram
Oregon Joint Use Association
1286 Court Street, NE
Salem, OR 97301
genoa@westernadvocates.com

John Sullivan
Oregon Joint Use Association
2213 SW 153<sup>rd</sup> Dr.
Beaverton, OR 97006
john.sullivan@pgn.com

William C. Woods Oregon Joint Use Association 9605 SW Nimbus Ave Beaverton, OR 97008 William\_woods@cable.comcast.com

Tom O'Connor Executive Director P.O. Box 928 Salem, OR 97308-0928 toconnor@teleport.com

Don Godard Oregon PUD Association 727 Center Street NE, Ste 305 Salem, OR 97301 dgodard@opuda.org Jack Evans
Oregon Rural Electric Cooperative Assn
3632 Se Dune Ave
Lincoln City, OR 97367-1740
ievans@oreca.org

Brant Wolf Executive Vice President Oregon Telecommunications Assn 707 13<sup>th</sup> St SE, Ste 280 Salem, OR 97301-4036 bwolf@ota-telecom.org

Cece L. Coleman
Pacific Power & Light
825 NE Multnomah, Ste 800
Portland, OR 97232
cece.coleman@pacificorp.com

William Eaquinto
Vice President of Operations
Pacific Power & Light
825 NE Multnomah, Ste 1700
Portland, OR 97232
bill.eaquinto@pacificorp.com

Corey Fitzgerald
Pacific Power & Light
825 NE Multnomah, Ste 800
Portland, OR 97232 corey.fitzgerald@pacificorp.com

Randall Miller Pacific Power & Light 1407 W. N. Temple, Ste 220 Salt Lake City, UT 84116 randy.miller@pacificorp.com

Bill Cunningham
Managing Director, Asset Management
Pacific Corp
825 NE Multnomah, Ste 1500
Portland, OR 97232
bill.cunningham@pacificorp.com

Heidi Caswell Pacific Corp 825 NE Multnomah St. Portland, OR 97232 heide.caswell@pacificorp.com

Pete Craven Pacific Corp 825 NE Multnomah, Ste 300 Portland, OR 97232

Jim Marquis
Director, O&M Support
Pacific Corp
830 Old Salem Rd.
Albany, OR 97321
james 1.marquis@pacificorp.com

Andrea L. Kelly
Vice President-Regulation
Pacific Corp DBA Pacific Power & Light
825 NE Multnomah Street, Ste 2000
Portland, OR 97232
andrea.kelly@pacificorp.com

General Manager Pioneer Telephone Cooperative 1304 Main St P.O. Box 631 Philomath, OR 97370

Richard Gray City of Portland-Office of Transportation 1120 SW 5<sup>th</sup> Ave, Rm 800 Portland, OR 97204 <u>richard.gray@pdxtrans.org</u>

Jennifer Bosch Portland General Electric 121 SW Salmon St. Portland, OR 97204 jennifer.bosch@pgn.com

Randall Dahlgren
Portland General Electric
121 SW Salmon St., 1WTC-0702
Portland, OR 97204
randy.dahlgren@pgn.com

Barbara Halle
Portland General Electric
121 SW Salmon St, 1 WTC-13
Portland, OR 97204
barbara.halle@pgn.com

Doug Kuns Portland General Electric 121 SW Salmon St Portland, OR 97204 doug.kuns@pgn.com

Inara K. Scott
Portland General Electric
121 SW Salmon St
Portland, OR 97204
inara.scott@pgn.com

John Sullivan
Portland General Electric
2213 SW 153<sup>rd</sup> Dr.
Beaverton, OR 97006
john.sullivan@pgn.com

David P. Van Bossuyt Portland General Electric 4245 Kale St, NE Salem, OR 97305 dave.vanbossuyt@pgn.com

Thomas Dixon Assistant General Counsel Verizon Corporate Services 707 17<sup>th</sup> Street Denver, CO 80202 thomas.f.dixon@verizon.com

Priorityone Telecommunications Inc. P.O. Box 758
La Grande, OR 97850-6462
<a href="mailto:kmutch@pltel.com">kmutch@pltel.com</a>

Jerry Murray Public Utility Commission P.O. Box 2148 Salem, OR 97308-2148 jerry.murray@state.or.us Gary Putnam
Public Utility Commission
P.O. Box 2148
Salem, OR 97308-2148
gary.putnam@state.or.us

Bob Sipler Public Utility Commission P.O. Box 2148 Salem, OR 97308-2148 bob.sipler@state.or.us

John Wallace Public Utility Commission P.O. Box 2148 Salem, OR 97308-2148 john.wallace@state.or.us

Frank McGovern Quality Telephone Inc. P.O. Box 141048 Dallas, TX 75214 frncgovern@qtelephone.com

Jeff Kent Qwest 8021 SW Capitol Hill Rd. Room 180 Portland, OR 97219 jeffrey. kent@qwest.com

Alex M. Duarte Qwest Corporation 421 SW Oak St, Ste 810 Portland, OR 97204 alex.duarte@qwest.com

Barbara Young Sprint Communications Co LP 902 Wasco St - ORHDRA0412 Hood River, OR 97031-3105 barbara.c.young@embarq.com Tom McGowan Sprint/United Telephone Co. of the NW 902 Wasco St Hood River, OR 97031 tom.a.mcgowan@sprint.com

Kevin O'Connor Time Warner Telecom 520 SW 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue Portland, OR 97204 Kevin.oconnor@twtelecom.com

Brian Thomas
Time Warner Telecom of Oregon LLC
223 Taylor Ave, N
Seattle, WA 98109-5017
brian.thomas@twtelecom.com

Steven Lindsay Verizon P.O. Box 1033 Everett, WA 98206 steve.lindsay@verizon.com

Richard Stewart Verizon Northwest Inc. 600 Hidden Ridge HQE03J28 Irving, TX 75038 richard.stewart@verizon.com

Renee Willer Verizon Northwest Inc. 20575 NW Von Neumann Dr, OR030156 Hillsboro, OR 97006 renee.willer@verizon.com

Marty Patrovsky
Wantel Inc.
1016 SE Oak Ave
Roseburg, OR 97470
marty.patrovsky@comspanusa.net