## **Noble Solutions Data Request 5.3**

Refer to PAC/400, Dickman/91: 11-13, stating: "There is no reliable way to determine the monetary value of freed-up RECs. Noble Solutions recommends using the average price of unstructured REC sales for 2015 to set the value of freed-up RECs for 2017".

Please provide the final purchase prices for RECs paid by PacifiCorp under the terms of the 2016 REC RFP, including for each transaction:

- (i) number of RECs;
- (ii) bundled / unbundled;
- (iii) vintage; and
- (iv) price paid for RECs.

This is an ongoing request that remains in effect if the Company enters into a final contract to purchase RECs after the date of this request.

## 1<sup>st</sup> Supplemental Response to Noble Solutions Data Request 5.3

The Company continues to object to this request as overly broad, unduly burdensome, and not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence. Without waiving these objections, the Company responds as follows:

Please refer to Highly Confidential Attachment Noble Solutions 5.3 1<sup>st</sup> Supplemental which provides information regarding executed transactions from the 2016 Renewable Energy Credit (REC) Request for Proposals (RFP). Note: there are additional transactions, not yet executed, and pending negotiation of transaction terms. These transactions are not included in Highly Confidential Attachment Noble Solutions 5.3 1<sup>st</sup> Supplemental.

The Highly Confidential Attachment is designated as Highly Protected Information under Modified Protective Order No. 16-231 and may only be disclosed to qualified persons as defined in that order.

## Noble Solutions/303 Page 2 Contains Highly Confidential Material Subject to Protective Order No. 16-231

Redacted from this Non-Confidential Exhibit