

January 12, 2015

Public Utility Commission of Oregon Attn: Filing Center 3930 Fairview Industrial Drive SE P.O. Box 1088 Salem, Oregon 97308-1088

RE: UM 1690

Obsidian Renewables appreciates the opportunity to offer comments on the Voluntary Renewable Energy Tariff study currently underway at the Oregon Public Utility Commission. Apologies for these comments being tardy, but after we read the comments of others we very much wanted to offer our point of view.

Most importantly, the idea of utilities offering a solid and genuine renewable energy choice to their customers is a very good idea that should be enthusiastically encouraged. Successful businesses offer products and services their customers want. Successful businesses usually enjoy better profit margins and greater revenue growth from well-tailored and premium offerings. There is no question in my mind that many customers of Portland General Electric and of Pacific Power are interested in having an electricity alternative less dependent on coal, and are willing to pay more for that choice. The sensible business decision is to find a way to offer such a product without forcing customers satisfied with the status quo into a similar choice.

Direct access is not a close proxy for the VRET. Direct access customers may leave and choose a renewable energy supply, but that is direct access, not VRET. VRET customers remain customers of the utility, and if the rate design is done correctly they become ever more important customers of the utility. Rather than making the VRET mirror or match direct access, I suggest we modify the direct access rules to allow fair and even competition with the new VRET. In other words, let's do everything we can to make the VRET a good product, and then improve the direct access rules to assure a level playing field. Of course, there are aspects of direct access that will inform VRET design, but the two are just not the same.

Direct access has been a very limited product that is not adopted by very many customers in number. Direct access has not proven to be a workable solution for a small business eager to "go green." The VRET was imagined to be that solution, and we should be very determined to make that happen.

I generally agree with most of the comments of PGE and PP&L. Flexibility is extremely important until the market informs us what it wants. It is very likely that different customers will want different products. Some will want to eliminate coal. Some will want to eliminate fossil

fuels. Some will want to do enough to create bragging rights, qualify for an environmental certification, or just feel better about how they use energy. Let's try to give the customers what they want.

Some of the larger and more sophisticated customers understand that renewable energy requires some subsidy in the early years but offers the promise of relatively level costs over the project life. Those customers have the capital and long view that makes control over future energy costs relevant today. The design of that type of VRET is important, but getting it right will be complicated and likely controversial. I suggest we start with easier alternatives.

I generally agree with the thoughtful and constructive comments of Renewable Northwest, particularly the idea that we ask the PUC to quickly approve two or three forms of VRET that can be implemented quickly, perhaps as pilots, to enable us to get experience to guide more final decisions. I think a 150 MW size for a pilot is sensible.

CUB's thoughtful comments are focused on legal issues, but I very much agree with CUB's idea that we try to develop a couple of concrete proposals now, before the next workshop, and ask the Commission to allow them on a provisional basis.

I would be happy to participate in a meeting to craft a couple of straw person proposals for circulation before the next workshop in February.

Thank you for your consideration of these comments.

David W. Brown

David W. En

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that I have this day caused OBSIDIAN RENEWABLES, LLC'S REPLY COMMENTS to be served by electronic mail to those parties whose email addresses appear on the attached service list for OPUC Docket No. UM 1690.

Dated in Portland, Oregon on this 12th day of January, 2015

Shannon Kimmel

Legal Assistant

Cable Huston, LLP

1001 SW Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000

Portland, Oregon 97204

(503) 224-3092

(503) 224-3176 – fax

skimmel@cablehuston.com

SERVICE LIST - UM 1690

January 12, 2015

CARL FINK W

628 SW CHESTNUT ST, STE 200

PORTLAND OR 97219 cmfink@blueplanetlaw.com

JIM STANWAY W

jimstanway@fb.com

*OREGON DEPARTMENT OF W **ENERGY**

> KACIA BROCKMAN SENIOR ENERGY POLICY

ANALYST

625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301-3737 kacia.brockman@state.or.us

JULIE PEACOCK

625 MARION ST NE SALEM OR 97301-3737 julie.peacock@state.or.us

ADOBE SYSTEMS W

KEVIN DEVAN

devan@adobe.com

AOC/CREA W

DORIS PENWELL

dpenwell@aocweb.org

ATKINS W

> SUZANNE LETA LIOU SENIOR DIVISION MANAGER

12725 SW MILLIKAN WAY, STE 230

PORTLAND OR 97005 suzanne.liou@atkinsglobal.com

W **ATKINS GLOBAL**

HEIDI GEN KUONG

1410 ROCKY RIDGE DRIVE

SUITE 140

ROSEVILLE CA 95661

heidi.genkuong@atkinsglobal.com

KIMBERLY KRUTSKI MACHLUS

482 SOUTH KELLER ROAD

ORLANDO FL 32810

kimberly.krutski@atkinsglobal.com

BONNEVILLE ENVIRONMENTAL W **FOUNDATION**

ANGUS DUNCAN **PRESIDENT**

240 SW FIRST AVE PORTLAND OR 97204 aduncan@b-e-f.org

CENTER FOR RESOURCE SOLUTIONS

> ROBIN QUARRIER CHIEF COUNSEL

1012 TORNEY AVENUE, 2ND FLOOR SANFRANCISCO CA 94122

robin@resource-solutions.org

W	CH2M HILI	
VV	CHENTIL	_

DICK SHEEHY

dick.sheehy@ch2m.com

W CITIZENS' UTILITY BOARD OF

OREGON

OPUC DOCKETS 610 SW BROADWAY, STE 400

PORTLAND OR 97205 dockets@oregoncub.org

JEFF BISSONNETTE

610 SW BROADWAY, STE 400

PORTLAND OR 97205 jeff@oregoncub.org

G. CATRIONA MCCRACKEN

610 SW BROADWAY, STE 400

PORTLAND OR 97205 catriona@oregoncub.org

W CITY OF HILLSBORO

SARAH GARRISON

sarah.garrison@hillsboro-oregon.gov

W CITY OF PORTLAND

ANDRIA JACOB

andria.jacob@portlandoregon.gov

W CITY OF PORTLAND - CITY

ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
BENJAMIN WALTERS

1221 SW 4TH AVE - RM 430

PORTLAND OR 97204

ben.walters@portlandoregon.gov

W CITY OF PORTLAND PLANNING & SUSTAINABILITY

MICHAEL ARMSTRONG

1900 SW 4TH AVE, STE 7100

PORTLAND OR 97201

michael.armstrong@portlandoregon.gov

DAVID TOOZE

1900 SW 4TH STE 7100 PORTLAND OR 97201

david.tooze@portlandoregon.gov

W CLEARING UP

JUDE NOLAND X

GIG HARBOR WA 00000 inoland@newsdata.com

W CLIMATE SOLUTIONS

ANN ENGLISH GRAVATT

610 SW BROADWAY STE 306 PORTLAND OR 97205

ann@climatesolutions.org

CONSTELLATION ENERGY

COMMODITIES GROUP, INC.

MARY LYNCH 5074 NAWAL DRIVE

EL DORADO HILLS CA 95762

mary.lvn	ch@constell	ation.com
----------	-------------	-----------

CREA W PMB 409 **BRIAN SKEAHAN** 18160 COTTONWOOD RD SUNRIVER OR 97707 brian.skeahan@yahoo.com **DAVISON VAN CLEVE** W 333 SW TAYLOR STE 400 JOSHUA D WEBER PORTLAND OR 97204 jdw@dvclaw.com DAVISON VAN CLEVE PC W 333 SW TAYLOR - STE 400 MELINDA J DAVISON PORTLAND OR 97204 mjd@dvclaw.com **ENERGY STRATEGIES LLC** W 215 STATE ST - STE 200 KEVIN HIGGINS SALT LAKE CITY UT 84111-2322 khiggins@energystrat.com **ENERGY TRUST OF OREGON** 421 SW OAK STE 300 THAD ROTH PORTLAND OR 97204 thad.roth@energytrust.org **FACEBOOK** W 561 GARDEN ST ANN BLACKWOOD SACRAMENTO CA 95815 annb@fb.com **GALLATIN PUBLIC AFFAIRS** W KELSEY WILSON kelseyw@gallatinpa.com W **IBERDROLA RENEWABLES** KOURTNEY NELSON kourtney.nelson@iberdrolaren.com SARA PARSONS sara.parsons@iberdrolaren.com IBERDROLA RENEWABLES, INC W 1125 NW COUCH ST STE 700 KEVIN LYNCH PORTLAND OR 97209 kevin.lynch@iberdrolaren.com **IBEW LOCAL 659** 4480 ROGUE VALLEY HWY #3 **BANJO REED** CENTRAL POINT OR 97520 banjo@ibew659.org

IDAHO POWER COMPANY

W

CONNIE ASCHENBRENNER

PO BOX 70

BOISE ID 83707-0070

caschenbrenner@idahopower.com

TAMI WHITE

PO BOX 70

BOISE ID 83707-0070 twhite@idahopower.com

MICHAEL YOUNGBLOOD

PO BOX 70

BOISE ID 83707

myoungblood@idahopower.com

KEYES, FOX AND WIEDMAN LLP W

JUSTIN BARNES

jbarnes@kfwlaw.com

KEYS, FOX & WIEDMAN LLP W

KIMBERLY KOOLES

kkooles@kfwlaw.com

LEGAL & CONSULTING W

SERVICES

PO BOX 25302

ANN L FISHER PORTLAND OR 97298-0302

ann@annfisherlaw.com

W LINDSAY HARD, LLP

PAUL COSGROVE

1300 SW 5TH AVENUE SUITE 3400

PORTLAND OR 97201

pcosgrove@lindsayhart.com

MULTNOMAH COUNTY W

DISTRICT 1

CHRISTINE LEWIS

christine.lewis@multco.us

NOBLE AMERICAS ENERGY W

SOLUTIONS, LLC

GREG BASS

401 WEST A ST., STE. 500 SAN DIEGO CA 92101

gbass@noblesolutions.com

NW & INTERMOUTAIN POWER W

PRODUCERS COALITION ROBERT D KAHN

PO BOX 504

MERCER ISLAND WA 98040

rkahn@nippc.org

NW ENERGY COALITION W

WENDY GERLITZ

1205 SE FLAVEL

PORTLAND OR 97202 wendy@nwenergy.org

FRED HEUTTE

PO BOX 40308

PORTLAND OR 97240-0308

fred@nwenergy.org

W **OBSIDIAN RENEWABLES** 5 CENTERPOINTE DR STE 590 **IMOGEN TAYLOR** LAKE OSWEGO OR 97035 itaylor@obsidianrenewables.com **OBSIDIAN RENEWABLES, LLC** w 5 CENTERPOINT DR, STE 590 DAVID BROWN LAKE OSWEGO OR 97035 dbrown@obsidianfinance.com **OREGON NATIONAL GUARD** W COLONEL CHRISTIAN F REES christian.f.rees.mil@mail.mil LTC KENNETH SAFE kenneth.safe.mil@mail.mil **OXLEY & ASSOCIATES** W **EVYAN JARVIS** evyanjarvis@oxleyandassociatesinc.com **PACIFIC POWER** W **ERIK ANDERSSON** 825 NE MULTNOMAH STE 800 PORTLAND OR 97232 erik.andersson@pacificorp.com **PACIFIC POWER & LIGHT** W 825 NF MULTNOMAH STE 2000 JOELLE STEWARD PORTLAND OR 97232 joelle.steward@pacificorp.com W **PACIFICORP** 825 NE MULTNOMAH, STE 2000 ALISA M DUNLAP PORTLAND OR 97232 alisa.dunlap@pacificorp.com RHONDA RASMUSSEN 825 NE MULTNOMAH STE 300 PORTLAND OR 97232 rhonda.rasmussen@pacificorp.com PORTLAND GENERAL ELECTRIC W BARBARA HALLE 121 SW SALMON ST 1 WTC-13 PORTLAND OR 97204 barbara.halle@pgn.com 121 SW SALMON ST. 1WTC0702 KARLA WENZEL PORTLAND OR 97204 pge.opuc.filings@pgn.com **PORTLAND GENERAL ELECTRIC** W **COMPANY**

J RICHARD GEORGE

121 SW SALMON ST 1WTC1301

PORTLAND OR 97204 richard.george@pgn.com

ELIZABETH PAUL

elizabeth.paul@pgn.com

W PORTLAND STATE UNIVERSITY

NOEL MINGO

noel.mingo@pdx.edu

W PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

OF OREGON

RUCHI SADHIR PO BOX 1088

SALEM OR 97308

ruchi.sadhir@state.or.us

W PUC STAFF--DEPARTMENT OF

JUSTICE

MICHAEL T WEIRICH BUSINESS ACTIVITIES SECTION

1162 COURT ST NE SALEM OR 97301-4096 michael.weirich@state.or.us

W RENEWABLE NORTHWEST

RENEWABLE NW DOCKETS 421 SW 6TH AVE., STE. 1125

PORTLAND OR 97204 dockets@renewablenw.org

MEGAN DECKER

421 SW 6TH AVE #1125 PORTLAND OR 97204-1629 megan@renewablenw.org

W RICHARDSON ADAMS, PLLC

GREGORY M. ADAMS PO BOX 7218

BOISE ID 83702

greg@richardsonadams.com

W SCHNITZER STEEL INDUSTRIES, INC

MATT RUCKWARDT

299 SW CLAY ST, STE 350 PORTLAND OR 97201 mruckwardt@schn.com

W SHELL ENERGY

JOHN LESLIE

600 WEST BROADWAY SUITE 2600

SAN DIEGO CA 92101 jleslie@mckennalong.com

W SOLARCITY

GENEVIEVE DUFAU

gdufau@solarcity.com

W WAL-MART STORES, INC.

STEVE W CHRISS 2001 SE 10TH ST

BENTONVILLE AR 72716-0550 stephen.chriss@wal-mart.com

W WALMART STORES INC

KEN BAKER 2001 SE 10TH ST

BENTONVILLE AR 72716 ken.baker@wal-mart.com

W WORLD RESOURCES INSTITUTE

LETHA TAWNEY

Itawney@wri.org

W YAM SERVICES

JACQUES GRANT

1819 SW 5TH AVE STE 342 PORTLAND OR 97201 electric@yamservices.com